

## **Meeting Transcript 4A**

**Miami City Commission  
February 25, 2022  
Morning Session**

Transcript of excerpt of video recording available at:  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SMkXuubavdE>

**PLAINTIFFS' TRIAL  
EXHIBIT**

**P4**

1:22-cv-24066-KMM

exhibitsticker.com

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Commissioner King: Can you hear me? Today is February 25th, 2022 we are going to start  
2 this meeting with a prayer from Commissioner Manolo Reyes. Here.

3 Commissioner Reyes: Could you please stand up and bow our heads? Okay. Dear Lord,  
4 thank you for giving us the opportunity to serve all people. Please guide so we can serve them for  
5 their own benefit and try to improve their quality of life, particularly those that need it the most,  
6 those that are and the Lord and of our income. Please guide us so we make the right decision in  
7 which we assure that everybody is represented in the city of Miami I ask that in the name of the  
8 father, the Holy Son, the Holy Ghost, and the Holy Son Amen.

9 Commissioner King: Commissioner, would you please honor us with the Pledge of  
10 Allegiance.

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair. Please stand up.  
12 I pledge allegiance to the flag — [Pledge of allegiance] Thank you.

13 Commissioner King: Thank you at this time, we are going to allow the consultants to make  
14 the presentation and then we will have public comment afterwards, Mr. De Grandy, I see the City  
15 Attorney flagging at me he's with me, he's with me huh-hu. We need to read something into the  
16 record, please do so City Attorney.

17 Victoria Méndez: Thank you, Madam Chair, any person who is a lobbyist pursuant to  
18 Chapter 2, Article 6 of the Code of the City of Miami must register with the City Clerk and comply  
19 with the related city requirements. Any person making a presentation, formal request, or petition  
20 to City Commission concerning real property must make the appropriate disclosures required by  
21 the city code. The City of Miami requires that anyone requesting action by the City Commission  
22 must disclose before the hearing any consideration provided or committed to anyone for agreement  
23 to support or withhold objection to a requested action pursuant to Section 2-8. In accordance with

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Section 233, F and G of the City Code, the agenda and material for each item on the agenda is  
2 available during business hours at the City Clerk's office and online 24 hours a day at  
3 [www.miami.gov.com](http://www.miami.gov.com). Any person may be heard by the City Commission through the Chair for not  
4 more than 2 minutes on any proposition before the City Commission. Public comment will begin  
5 in approximately a few minutes. Members of the public wishing to address the body may do so by  
6 submitting written comments via the online comment form, please visit  
7 [www.miami.gov.com/meetinginstructions](http://www.miami.gov.com/meetinginstructions) for detailed instructions on how to provide public  
8 comment using the online public comment form. The comments submitted through the comment  
9 form have been and will be distributed to elected officials and city administrations throughout the  
10 day so the elected officials can consider the comments prior to taking any action. Additionally, the  
11 online comment form will remain open during the meeting to accept comments and distribute to  
12 the elected officials up until the Chair closes a public comment, public comment can also be  
13 provided here at City Hall at 3500 Pan American Drive, subject to any and all city rules that may  
14 be amended. Speakers and attendees who appear in person will be subject to screening for  
15 symptoms of COVID-19. In addition, all city employees and visitors should try to wear facial  
16 coverings while at City Hall. If the proposition is being rescheduled, the opportunity to be heard  
17 may be at such a later date. When addressing the City Commission, the member of the public must  
18 first state his or her name, his or her address, and what item will be spoken about. Any person with  
19 a disability requiring assistance, auxiliary aids and services for this meeting may notify the City  
20 Clerk. The city has provided different public comment methods to indicate, among other things, a  
21 public support and opposition or neutrality on items on the agenda today. The public has been  
22 given the opportunity to provide public comment during the meeting within reasonable proximity  
23 before the meeting. Anyone wishing – and that's it. Thank you so much.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Commissioner King: Thank you, Victoria. Mr. City Clerk, do you need to make any  
2 announcements?

3 Todd Hannon: No, ma'am.

4 Commissioner King: Okay, perfect. Mr. De Grandy, you may begin your presentation.

5 Mr. De Grandy: Thank you, Madam Chair and good morning, Commissioners. For the  
6 record, this is now the fourth advertised public hearing we have on redistricting and per your  
7 directives on February 22nd, we provided each one of your officers with a detailed report on the  
8 revised plan that we will be presenting today. In our presentation today, we will recap some of the  
9 information in that plan, and I'll try to move as quickly as possible, since I assume you've already  
10 reviewed the 33-page report. Now, of course, after my presentation concludes, I'm happy to answer  
11 any questions or concerns you may have.

12 Now, first, permit me to recap some of the discussion that occurred in the prior hearing and  
13 the direction we were provided. As you know, on February 7th, we had our third public meeting  
14 in which we presented a preliminary redistricting plan to this commission. The preliminary plan  
15 brought down your current overall deviation of 42+% to 3.8%. It included four districts where  
16 minority residents had an equal opportunity to elect the candidate of their choice, and it was  
17 developed based on the traditional redistricting criteria you asked us to utilize in developing the  
18 plan. Now, during that hearing, there was significant public comment, and the vast majority of  
19 speakers opposed having the Grove in more than one district. There was commission discussion  
20 on that issue, and a motion, which in essence was to maintain US 1 as a hard boundary to D2 in  
21 order to maintain all of the Grove in one district. That motion died for lack of a second. Later on  
22 there was a motion which was adopted, directing us to consider going south of US 1 into D2 to  
23 balance population. There was also direction on restoring the part of D5 where the MRC is located.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 At your direction, I met with each one of you between the last meeting and this one to get additional  
2 input. Some we were able to consider, some we were not able to implement.

3 And so here are some highlights of the plan. First, although we had clear direction to allow  
4 us to use areas south of US 1 to equalize population in other districts, we reduced the number of  
5 residents moved from the Grove to other districts by more than half, from 6,384 to 2,930 and 89.  
6 All of that reduction came from the area south of US 1 that was initially moved into D4. By moving  
7 the boundary up from Day Avenue to Bird Avenue, we reduced the amount of residents moved  
8 into D4 from 5,071 to 1,597. As to that area, there were concerns expressed that we were moving  
9 497 Black residents from D2 to D4. The revised plan reduces that number to 114. There was also  
10 discussion about keeping Bay Heights and D2, so we reconfigured the area south of US 1 that we  
11 brought into D3 to keep Bay Heights in D2. We followed your direction to keep the MRC in D5,  
12 but that resulted in having to move approximately 2,500 residents that we had been able to move  
13 into D1 back into D2. Now, by reconfiguring areas around the boundaries of D5, we were also  
14 able to slightly increase the total Black population, as well as the voting age population, above  
15 50%. However, because we move less people out of D2 than in our preliminary plan, D2's  
16 deviation increased from a negative .02 to a positive point, uh, 5.46. All other districts are slightly  
17 below the ideal population number, next slide, Steve, with deviations anywhere from -.41 to -2.14.  
18 Now, the changes that we made as a result of your additional direction resulted in an increase in  
19 overall deviation from 3.81 in our preliminary plan to 7.6 in the plan we present today. The overall  
20 deviation is still within the caselaw's acceptable range, and there are rational bases for the  
21 deviations in the plan, and we will document that further when we provide our final report on  
22 March 11th.

23 Now let's review the data revised in the revised plan. Then we could look at the district

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 configurations. Okay, next slide, District 1 is at a -.41 deviation, which is 340 residents below the  
2 ideal. It has an 88% Hispanic population with 89.5% Hispanic voting age population, it clearly  
3 complies with the Voting Rights Act. District 2, next slide, now has a +5.46 deviation, which is  
4 4,832 residents above the ideal. District 2 remains a swing district with 37% white non-Hispanic  
5 population, approximately 7.5% Black population, and roughly 48.7% Hispanic population.  
6 Voting age percentages are almost the same as the total population percentages. D3 is slightly  
7 underpopulated at a -0.92 or 810 people under the ideal population. District 3 has an 87.25%  
8 Hispanic population and approximately 88.3% Hispanic voting age population, and consistent with  
9 the Voting Rights Act, the Hispanic community has an equal opportunity to elect the candidate of  
10 its choice. District 4 is now slightly underpopulated with a -2% deviation or 1,774 residents below  
11 the ideal. 88.2% of the population is Hispanic, with 89.5% Hispanic voting age population. As I  
12 said before, the drop in population compared to our preliminary plan was a direct result of reducing  
13 the number of Grove residents that we had moved from D2 to D4. The district also complies with  
14 the requirements of the Voting Rights Act.

15 Now finally, we underpopulated D5 by roughly 2.14 under the ideal, this allowed us to  
16 slightly increase the Black voting percentage. The proposed district is now approximately 52.2%  
17 Black, with approximately 50.3% Black voting age population. Our analysis of voting patterns  
18 indicates that, consistent with the requirements of the VRA, the Black community does have an  
19 equal opportunity to elect the candidate of its choice.

20 So now let me show you some of the maps to further illustrate what we just discussed. The  
21 first slide shows the entire configuration of proposed District 1. As you can see, it maintains the  
22 vast majority of the core of the existing district. In fact, D1 still retains slightly over 92% of its  
23 current population. Now the next slide shows two of the changes we did on the northern border

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 between D1 and D5, and as I said before, we worked around the edges of the borders of D5 which  
2 allowed us to reconfigure and slightly increase D5's Black voting age population.

3 The next slide shows the movement we made in the south part of D1, taking population  
4 from D5. Now the preliminary plan had this movement going even further southeast. But however,  
5 in order to keep the MRC in D5, we had to reduce this movement with a new boundary at the I-95  
6 expressway. Again, we felt this movement was needed because Hispanics in this area constitute  
7 roughly 70% of the population. Thus, they have greater voter cohesion, which is one of the factors  
8 you asked us to consider with D1 residents.

9 Now the next slide is of the proposed District 5. The proposed District 5 also maintains  
10 over 91% of its current population, and it was the most challenging district to develop. Our only  
11 options were to move south and across the river to D3, west into D1, or east into D2. We already  
12 showed the slight changes we did between D1 and D5, and D3 is currently the most underpopulated  
13 district, so it was not feasible to cross the river to take population from D3. And so we use a  
14 significant amount of the population of D2 in the east in order to balance population.

15 Now the next two slides show the population we move from D2 to D5. This first slide  
16 shows the movements on the northeast part of D5 shifting the eastern boundary to NE 2nd Avenue.  
17 The next slide shows that same movement further down on the southern end, also shifting the  
18 boundary to 2nd Avenue. Now, simply stated, we cannot move further east without diminishing  
19 the African-American community's opportunity to elect a candidate of choice.

20 The next slide is of the proposed District 3. As the most underpopulated district, D3 also  
21 needed to increase in population. It was not feasible to cross the river to the north, so our options  
22 were to move east, west or south. We did not feel it was appropriate to move east because of  
23 dissimilar demographics. And the next slide now shows the movements we made, taking

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 population from D4 into D3. It spans from NW 7th Street to the north to SW 8th Street to the  
2 south, and from 27th to 32nd Avenue. Again, this was done to balance population, and in that  
3 regard we tried to find adjacent areas with similar demographics in order to maintain voter  
4 cohesion, one of your standards, while rebalancing population.

5 Now the next slide finally shows the area we move from D2 to D3. Now, as I stated before  
6 at the February 7th meeting, there was discussion about keeping Bay Heights in D2 and so we  
7 reconfigured the area south of US 1 that initially moved to D3 in the preliminary plan. The new  
8 configuration now keeps all of Bay Heights, which is to the north of this movement, within D2,  
9 and this was done again to balance population. Nevertheless, D3 is still roughly 1%  
10 underpopulated.

11 The next slide is of the proposed District 4. It remains a highly Hispanic area and retains  
12 close to 93% of its existing population. The next two slides show the area we added to D4 from  
13 D2. This first slide shows the movements we made north of US 1, consisting of roughly 10,500  
14 people. The second slide shows the reduced movement we made south of US 1, and we reduced  
15 the amount of people we moved in our preliminary plan from 5,071 to 1,597. Now in that  
16 preliminary plan, we had overpopulated this district at 2.23, but because of the changes we made  
17 to keep more of the Grove population in D2, it resulted in reversing that number, so that D4 now  
18 has a -2% deviation.

19 Now the next slide shows all of D2. As you can see, it remains a coastal district spanning  
20 almost the entire north-south corridor of the city along the bay. But because it was over 32%  
21 overpopulated and we had to move a significant percentage of population into other districts, D2  
22 only retains approximately 80% of its existing population. Now we've already covered all the areas  
23 we move from D2 to other districts. But to recap, in the next slide, we moved 10,496 people into



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 D5, 12,093 people into D4, 1,392 people into D3. In total we moved almost 24,000 people of the  
2 more than 28,000 excess population of D2 into other districts. As you may recall, in our  
3 preliminary plan, we designed this district with almost zero deviation because we felt that based  
4 on historical trends, it would be the district with the largest increase in population in the next  
5 decade. But to comply with the directives to restore the MRC back into D5 and to minimize the  
6 movement of Grove residents, it resulted in a decrease, excuse me, increase in D2's population to  
7 5.46 over the ideal.

8 So now, next slide, taking D2 as your high point and the -2.14 deviation of D5 as your low  
9 point, the revised plan now has an overall deviation of 7.6. Again, this deviation is within  
10 acceptable parameters and is based on implementation of rational criteria directed by this  
11 Commission, including minimizing the number of residents south of US 1 that were relocated.  
12 Thus, the caselaw would allow for these deviations to accomplish these directives. And finally,  
13 the last slide gives you an overview of the entire plan.

14 So in summary, we're confident that our revised plan complies with constitutional and  
15 Voting Rights Act criteria. We were also cognizant of the directives you gave us. Every district  
16 maintains the core configuration and the vast majority of its existing population. We restored the  
17 MRC to D5. We increased D5's Black voting age population above 50%. Wherever possible, we  
18 tried to move population based on similar demographics and voting patterns in order to maintain  
19 voter cohesion. We stayed well below the 10% threshold. Finally, there was a directive to maintain  
20 communities of interest and traditional neighborhoods when feasible. However, as you know,  
21 many of the city's traditional neighborhoods were already split in the current plan. Moreover,  
22 because the current configurations and the directives to maintain the core of existing districts as  
23 well as a need to balance population, the directive to maintain communities of interest and

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 traditional neighborhoods could not be substantially achieved. And with that, I'm happy to answer  
2 any questions you may have.

3 Commissioner King: I believe Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla would like to make a  
4 comment clarification?

5 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: A clarification Mr. De Grandy, your deviation ended up  
6 being 7.6%, correct?

7 Mr. De Grandy: Overall deviation 7.6%.

8 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: 7.6%. Did you overpopulate District 2?

9 Mr. De Grandy: Yes at 5.46.

10 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: And that shifted the deviation of 7.6, right? That raised  
11 it, increased it?

12 Mr. De Grandy: Yes, sir.

13 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Did you plan out what's going to happen in the next six,  
14 eight years, ten years into you into that deviation? Or do you think that deviation is too high  
15 because what potentially can happen in next four, six, eight years?

16 Mr. De Grandy: I've expressed my opinion, and that's why in the preliminary plan, I had  
17 it at zero deviation.

18 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Of course.

19 Mr. De Grandy: I've expressed my opinion based on historical trends. That is probably the  
20 district that is going to grow the most in the next decade and so I would I put it in the preliminary  
21 plan and zero deviation, but the directives that you all gave me resulted in increasing that deviation.

22 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: So, the follow up, in your professional opinion, do you  
23 believe that that kind of deviation is too high and is District 2 overpopulated? Projecting over a

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 10-year period, too high in the sense that, it's okay for today; is it okay for 2022 to 2024 or 2026  
2 moving down the line?

3 Mr. De Grandy: What I could tell you, Commissioner, is A, the deviation is within  
4 acceptable ranges, so it's legal,

5 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Today?

6 Mr. De Grandy: Now, from a policy or practical perspective, you may very well see the  
7 same thing you saw in the last decade with that district being, significantly within ten years,  
8 overpopulated, and that's again why I had initially put it at zero deviation.

9 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Okay. Thank you.

10 Commissioner Joe Carollo: If I may, Commissioner, and I think that's a very good question  
11 that you asked. I uh, and it was one that I looked at it. My district, for instance. Just in one  
12 development uh that's right by José Martí Park uh, there's some 2000-unit apartments and condos  
13 that are coming 2000 so even if you multiply just by 2 that's 4000 more people, that's in one  
14 development which several towers. You take along the river in my district, you take along 8th  
15 Street. You take along NW 7th Street and a lot of big buildings that are coming up so I I feel safe  
16 to say that in District 3 it will more than keep up with the new population levels in the next ten  
17 years. Now going over in your district, I'm looking along the river, the types of development that  
18 you're having umm that are not fully full and some are not fully built and others that are coming  
19 into play in the next four or five years. You're going to have a significant amount of new people  
20 that are going to be living in these projects also in your district. Commissioner King in the coastal  
21 areas that she has will be getting increases, I'm not as familiar in that area. But she will be getting  
22 increases. Commissioner Reyes is the one that has basically the most homestead single family  
23 homes by far with the least amount of buildings and skyscrapers that could possibly be built. But

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 still, in his district along 8th street, Flagler, there's quite a bit of construction that's coming into  
2 play.

3 Commissioner Reyes: And excuse me, but right now we have ah and ah and ah you know  
4 that Commissioner Russell, there's in 27th Avenue into an and 27th US 1 there's a huge  
5 development there.

6 Commissioner Carollo: And 37th.

7 Commissioner Reyes: And 37th, there's a huge amount of residents, I mean, all of housing  
8 units that or apartments that are going to be built there.

9 Commissioner Carollo: I mentioned the one in my side and District 3 because I'm hoping  
10 that that could be changed somewhat. But you're right.

11 Commissioner Reyes: One more thing —

12 Commissioner Carollo: No, I'm saying that the development in District 3 that I'm having  
13 from Metrorail, I didn't mention it because I'm hoping that it's not going to be quite like the county  
14 ones.

15 Commissioner King: Commissioner Russell?

16 Commissioner Russell: Thank you, Madam Chair and I think you're right. This is a very  
17 healthy discussion because none of us have a crystal ball. But I think the paradigm on development  
18 in the city of Miami is going to shift from what we saw over the last boom, let's say after the last  
19 crash in '08. Everything that was built from then, you saw this massive District 2, downtown, and  
20 Edgewater surge after Miami 21 changed. But the capacity is getting reached and you've seen just  
21 by the SAP's that have been written, they're not happening in D2 as much. They're happening in  
22 Little Haiti, they're happening in Allapattah and the RTZ will be the biggest change of of density  
23 and intensity that the county will do with unfettered. You know, that's another issue we're dealing

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 with at commission, but that is all along the transit quarters that will affect, of course, District 4  
2 on US 1 and District 3 when it gets to Vizcaya and District 5 when it gets to downtown, that is all  
3 looking to be RTZ massive growth outside of District 2. But I don't think any of us can actually  
4 predict what's going to happen.

5 Commissioner King: What I'd like to do now is open the meeting for public comment and  
6 I'm asking when you come up to speak, please, if you don't have to remain. Give some people  
7 who are outside the opportunity to come in because the chambers are crowded today so once you  
8 speak, if you can step outside to allow others to come in to speak as well, I would appreciate it.

9 Commissioner Carollo:: Madam Chairman, if I may request something of the chair, if we  
10 could ask of all speakers if they could at least let us know if they don't want to let us know where  
11 they live at, exactly what district are they from that they live in so that we can get an idea of where  
12 the people that are speaking, what district are they from.

13 Commissioner King: Yes, please. That would be helpful to us if you could just, you have  
14 to give your name. You don't have to say where you live. But if you would like, we would love  
15 for you to say what district you reside in, and you can give your address if you choose to, but  
16 you're not required to correct Mr. City Clerk?

17 Mr. Hannon: We can require if its requested.

18 Ms. Méndez: We actually we actually do and it's been umm allowed.

19 Commissioner King: You require it?

20 Ms. Méndez: It's been allowed through caselaw.

21 Commissioner King: I see okay. There you go so your name, your address, and if you can  
22 tell us what district you live in, what would be helpful for us. Thank you.

23 Carole Jackson: Thank you. Good morning, commissioners. Good morning, Chairman

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 King. Good morning. Through the chair, Commissioners, my name is Carole Jackson I uhh do not  
2 live in the city of Miami, but I represent both district, both branches of the NAACP, the South  
3 Dade Branch of the NAACP in the Miami-Dade Branch of the NAACP and through that, I  
4 represent our members and constituents who live in all five districts of the city of Miami. Uhm I  
5 am second vice president of the South Dade Branch of the NAACP and I have a statement for you  
6 and a letter for you that I'd like to give to the to the clerk. The NAACP holds that the right of  
7 Black communities to vote in conditions that result in its voice being heard as the greatest right  
8 this democracy office, offers. As such, the South Dade and Miami-Dade branches of the NAACP  
9 are greatly concerned by efforts to redistrict the West Grove. Since prior to the incorporation of  
10 the City of Miami back in 1896, West Grove has always been a part of the Coconut Grove, and we  
11 support keeping Coconut Grove together. Therefore, we oppose any effort that would dilute the  
12 Black vote within District 2, and we furthermore oppose any dismantling of the Black vote in  
13 District 5. Commissioners, thank you for your opportunity to speak.

14 Commissioner King: Thank you

15 Commissioner Carollo: Uh Chair If I may. Just, I think we need to clear something up right  
16 from the beginning. The West Grove in the new plan that's being given is being kept intact, intact.  
17 If anything, it's going to gain a little more political say-so in District 2. Uh, District 5 is not being  
18 deleted, it's been increased on the Black vote and the percentage. So both of your concerns are not  
19 there.

20 Carole Jackson: I look forward to seeing the numbers. Thank you.

21 Commissioner Carollo: Sure.

22 Commissioner King: Thank you, sir?

23 Tony Scornavacca : Good afternoon I'm Tony Scornavacca, I live at 2630 SW 28th Street

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 in Coconut Grove. District 2. Commissioner Reyes, Commissioner Carollo, Commissioner King,  
2 Commissioner Russell. Thank you for serving the city of Miami. In regard to redistricting Coconut  
3 Grove is our city's oldest community. It is one community. Redistricting can be accomplished a  
4 thousand different ways. We have maybe 20,000 people in Coconut Grove, maybe 90,000 or more  
5 in District 2 of the other 70,000 people in District 2, it's easy to accomplish the goals of the  
6 redistricting plan by moving other areas. US 1 is a logical boundary, it would be impractical to  
7 move around those pieces when they don't need to be moved. They could have drawn the line  
8 down 27th Avenue to the bay. We could have had the Coconut Grove Arts Festival in two different  
9 districts. By the way the commissioners, in my opinion we did hear that these meetings were  
10 advertised it was a surprise to this group. They may have been advertised, but we have pastors of  
11 churches and we have homeowner associations that the commissioners you might want to try this  
12 and reach out and talk to. You all would be very well received if you reached out to a homeowner's  
13 group and asked to share your ideas, asked to share your redistricting plans, because although they  
14 were advertised, it was a surprise to the residents. So please, let's take another look at the plan.  
15 Let's keep Coconut Grove intact as one community. Thank you. [clapping follows]

16 Commissioner King: uuum I don't know how many times I have to say that, but Sergeant  
17 at Arms, if anyone else in here claps escort them out, I have said it in several meetings it is not  
18 appropriate in here and we have too much work to do and too many people who want to speak to  
19 have you clapping every single time someone says something that you're in favour of. And  
20 secondly, I don't know about my colleagues, but I had a community meeting with my district on  
21 Tuesday, which was also videoed and you can watch it on YouTube. Please do not clap in here  
22 again or you will be escorted out. Ma'am, oh and also, don't waste any time saying hello to us  
23 because you have 2 minutes and I'm very strict with the 2 minutes so just get to the business of

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 what you would like us to know.

2 Carolyn Donaldson: Okay.

3 Commissioner King: Thank you.

4 Carolyn Donaldson: You can hear me now.

5 Commissioner King: I had turned off the mic I'm sorry.

6 Carolyn Donaldson: Okay.

7 Commissioner King: Welcome, welcome.

8 Carolyn Donaldson: I thought it was maybe just me.

9 Commissioner King: No, it was it was me.

10 Carolyn Donaldson: Okay, great. Thank you. My name is Carolyn Donaldson, I'm on the  
11 board of Macedonia Missionary Baptist Church, the oldest Black church in the community. I also  
12 represent GRACE, Grove Rights and Equity, Inc. as their vice chair, and I also grew up in Coconut  
13 Grove. And back during those days we were just the Grove, wasn't East or West or any of those,  
14 we were just the Grove, and as the oldest continuous community in Miami-Dade County, I found  
15 it a travesty of the initial proposals to split up this community. And even though I'm hearing today  
16 that the resulting redistricting won't affect West Grove, and I'm actually glad to hear that, I hope  
17 that that ends up as part of the final plan, because it would have been a tremendous setback given  
18 the strides that we have made most recently. So I'm for One Grove and I think we should stay as  
19 one unity and if a result of that is that we see West Grove become the vibrant community that it  
20 was once when I was growing up. That would be amazing. Thank you.

21 Commissioner King: Thank you, ma'am?

22 Marlene Erven : Thank you. My name is Marlene Erven, I've lived in Coconut Grove  
23 almost 40 years, I live at 3066 Washington Street. I am president of the Coconut Grove Park



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Homeowner's Association and former president of the Women's Club of Coconut Grove. Thanks  
2 for the opportunity to provide comments today. I think we are all aware that Miami was seated  
3 right here in Coconut Grove, beginning with the first wave of immigration in 1825. Coconut Grove  
4 remains today, as has been mentioned, the oldest continuously inhabited neighborhood in Miami  
5 and Miami-Dade County. We wish you to keep the village of Coconut Grove united. We are also  
6 one of the few remaining historic landmark villages in Florida. I would like to go on record as  
7 being opposed to this redistricting proposal as it stands now, upon initial review, it splits  
8 neighborhoods, it splits our commercial district, and it splits our historic West Grove. There has  
9 not been sufficient notice for residents to consider the unintended consequences that this plan could  
10 have. Alternative district boundaries are possible. I support the One Grove plan that keeps the  
11 Grove united in one cohesive unit, unites neighborhoods previously divided. Protects shared  
12 backgrounds and interests, simplifies leadership burdens, and anticipates growth. On behalf of  
13 Coconut Grove Homeowners Association, we wish to have the opportunity to analyse this proposal  
14 and its potential effects and ask that you carefully review this plan with stakeholders in a citywide  
15 forum and be open to improvement and that you be open to improvements to the proposal. We  
16 urge you to keep one Grove at US 1, keep our historic, unified neighborhoods and organizations  
17 of the Grove, keep Coconut Grove's racial diversity. Keep the link between North and South Grove  
18 and alternative and better district boundaries are available. We ask that you be open to discussion.  
19 Thank you.

20 Commissioner King: Good afternoon.

21 Andy Parrish: Good afternoon, commissioners. My name is Andy Parrish I live at 3940  
22 Main Highway, which is on the Commodore Trail in a house that once served as the Sunshine  
23 Fruit Company in dating back to 1909. Today, One Grove and the citizens of the village of Coconut

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Grove, North, South, Central and Village West, will demonstrate democracy in action. True  
2 democracy, where ordinary citizens of various colors, ethnicities, income levels and political  
3 inclinations come together in support of one Grove, supporting each other and speaking with one  
4 voice. The citizens who will address you today will ask you to respect US 1 as the natural boundary  
5 for historic Coconut Grove. Just as it has been ever since it was a dirt road with a railroad beside  
6 it. We will demonstrate for you openly and with facts obtained by census experts hired by ordinary  
7 citizens with their own money, one, that there are other alternatives, better alternatives for  
8 redistricting than the one and only plan that your hired consultant has proposed as your starting  
9 point and that you are now preparing to tweak. And two, that, the African-American citizen, a  
10 resident of West Coconut Grove, the protection of whose voting rights are at the very heart of the  
11 Federal Voting Act, unanimously object to Mr. De Grandy's proposal. That three, that any  
12 redistricting proposal requires adequate time and clear documentation as required by our  
13 government in the sunshine laws for meaningful citizen participation in the process. And four,  
14 finally dividing long established neighborhoods into two districts and now three districts makes  
15 all citizen initiatives more difficult and is a bad idea. Not only for the Grove but for the whole city  
16 that you represent. We are one Grove seeking one voice to represent all of us with US 1 remaining  
17 as the boundary of historic Coconut Grove. Thank you very much, Commissioner.

18 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

19 Charles Monroe: May I ask the court for a presentation, Madam Chairman?

20 Commissioner King: I'm sorry Is it going to be 2 minutes?

21 Charles Monroe: Yes, I am going to speak for 2 minutes.

22 Commissioner King: Okay anybody can speak for 2 minutes If it's going to take longer  
23 than 2 minutes, someone can give you, their time.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Charles Monroe: No.

2 Commissioner King: No. Two oh, 2 minutes so you're right. Go ahead.

3 Charles Monroe: Yes hello, commissioners. My name is Charles Monroe, and I live in  
4 Coconut Grove at 3530 St. Gaudens Court. And, you know, my great grandfather came here in the  
5 1870s and he built a house and settled in Coconut Grove and it's now state state park or The  
6 Barnacle. And back then, you know, the Grove community was a community, and it was formed  
7 long before the city of Miami and it was unique and there were several things that made it unique.  
8 But above all, it was this diversity in its spirit okay and that's what formed its character. It was  
9 formed by northerners who had a transcendental background, combined with the name Black  
10 Bahamian settlers, who helped build much of the community, along with a whole cast of  
11 international characters in this form. The spirit of a community and the community, if you look at  
12 the map here on this, is an historic map on the screen it goes from Biscayne Bay okay, all the way  
13 to US 1 and that's the historic community of Coconut Grove and we need to preserve that as one  
14 community. And something else I'll ask you here, a lot of people here talk today about how when  
15 you split into three districts, people are going to have a hard time having a voice okay, but it's  
16 going to make your jobs harder, too how can you devote the time needed to understand a little  
17 sliver of Coconut Grove? I would we postulate that whoever is the commissioner of District 2 is  
18 going to know those areas way better than the commissioners in the other districts. And our citizens  
19 and our residents deserve to have commissioners that represent their interests and know them well.  
20 And then to the extent that they do get involved, those commissioners are going to send those those  
21 enclaves in the different directions okay, you have one Grove, you can have one one voice. You're  
22 going to go in one direction. You have three commissioners involved, you know, they're going to  
23 influence development, they're going to influence the services that are provided and you're going

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 to send the Grove into three areas so

2 Commissioner King: Thank you

3 Charles Monroe: The last thing is, Please.

4 Commissioner King: No Thank you,

5 Charles Monroe: Please —

6 Commissioner King: Thank you.

7 Unidentified speaker: [from background]

8 Commissioner King: What? He's he's he's That's all, that's all, he's done, okay, good  
9 morning?

10 Andreas Atave: Good afternoon.

11 Commissioner King : Good afternoon.

12 Andreas Atave: Andreas Atave, 9000 North Bayshore. Uuuh I've been involved in  
13 advocating for different communities, including Coconut Grove, for a long time. Uh I live in  
14 Edgewater but I understand the other neighborhoods because I've been involved with them for a  
15 long time. And I understand that redistricting is always difficult and its controversial that was  
16 expected. But in the proposal technically if you look at population zoning everything else it could  
17 be technically appropriate. But historically is it doesn't look like it's appropriate because you have  
18 a lot of opposition. There is opposition in other neighborhoods, but especially in Coconut Grove,  
19 because the biggest point is that Coconut Grove has a history of community that will be destroyed  
20 and if there is something they should be preserved is their sense of community that Coconut Grove  
21 has and other districts don't. Edgewater is a fairly new neighborhood that doesn't have the history  
22 of Coconut Grove. Downtown they have a lot of people that don't live there permanently so it's  
23 the same situation. You can probably, we can probably accept that Brickell has a history of

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 community, but nothing so deep as Coconut Grove has. So what this has created is not so difficult,  
2 not – sorry, no, so easy to create and it’s almost unanimous opposition to the division of Coconut  
3 Grove, thank you.

4 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

5 Linda Williams: Good afternoon, Madam Chair. Commissioners. I’m Linda Williams at  
6 3523 Charles Avenue. Temporarily at 3517 Hibiscus Street. I’ve lived here born and raised for 68  
7 years. To those who may be counting I’m here today not as a single resident, but representing my  
8 community by way a Vice President, Coconut Grove Homeowners and Tenants and Vice Chair,  
9 Community Advisory. I’m bringing their voices before you and there are many, not just me. The  
10 village voice community has long been left out, positive planning for revitalization, affordable  
11 housing, jobs, etc, etc. Yet he’s still come before us asking for your vote. For our vote and in  
12 return, we’re met with unmet promises and diminished hope. Now, with the thought of dividing a  
13 few of our neighbours, families and friends into another district prompts the concern of voter  
14 suppression. Because our small contribution to another district will certainly not change much for  
15 them but then taking out of the Village West so citizens will change or have a negative impact on  
16 us. Many politicians have relied on this small community to be taken over the threshold to victory.  
17 Finally the Village West community has much, much, much history and provide the city of Miami  
18 a gift of inspiration, motivated talent and vibrant character as we welcome diversity of cultures,  
19 we may not all get along —

20 Commissioner King: Thank you

21 Linda Williams: But we are united.

22 Commissioner King: Thank you.

23 Linda Williams: Thank you.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

Commissioner King: Good afternoon?

Jehades Rashid: Good afternoon. My name is Jehades Rashid, live in District 2 at 2983 Washington Street, 35 year resident of Coconut Grove, 20 years in the Village West. I've contributed significantly to the development of this community. I want to go on record to say any diminution of Coconut Grove will create other inefficiencies that this measure seeks to rectify. So we don't change one problem from another. Because of our culture, our history, and not topography if we would change our representation, it would create great inefficiencies in government. And then I have to draw upon my civic lessons as the grade student, grade school student. Government of the people, by the people. I've heard your consultant talk about the directions that was given to him by this commission, and we respect you and we are deferential. But make no mistake about it, we are given the directions and we are directing our representatives to find ways and means to address this problem without any diminution of our community by representation. This is no different than if it was gerrymandering based on race, because culturally, Coconut Grove is one. And to harken from the late Ann Richardson, Texas, don't mess with Coconut Grove. Thank you.

Harvey Gonzalez: Good afternoon, commissioners. My name is Harvey Gonzales, 3622 Solana Road, Miami, Florida, and the map before you is something that is well done in a redistricting. It takes a portion of what was District 2 and gives it to the proper district, which is District 4. I personally own property in that district and kind of grew up there. My first job was at Douglas Park and I think I used to make \$0.77 an hour, it was really great. But I know the area very well and that is something that is well done because when I ran for District 2, there was a lot of folks in there that didn't have the representation that they needed or required. And I remember going in there, they had changed the precincts so we had voters that were voting in the wrong

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 precinct. They were trying to go over there and if you ever saw disenfranchised folks, Hispanics  
2 like myself that were working hard and would get to the polling place and they were told, this isn't  
3 your poll, you had to go there. The frustration that we felt and that I felt as a candidate was painful,  
4 it was sad so by doing this, I commend you. This is the right thing to do. But now you're doing it  
5 to Coconut Grove and you're splitting Coconut Grove the same way you want to split something  
6 else. Just because the other districts are split. That doesn't mean anything. Coconut Grove is a  
7 historic neighborhood, it is the oldest neighborhood in the city of Miami, it is one of the most  
8 passionate neighborhoods in the city of Miami. You're obviously going to see this today so to be  
9 able to split it, to be able to move in, it just doesn't make sense. You're doing the same thing that  
10 was done 10 years ago to this district and I think that's something that we have to take into  
11 consideration. Respect our section, respect the Grove, please. That's all we're asking. Thank you.

12 Mel Meinhardt: Madam. Madam Chairman. Commissioners, my name is Mel Meinhardt,  
13 I live on Virginia Street in Coconut Grove. I want to thank Mr. De Grandy for illustrating here, as  
14 he did a few weeks ago, the criteria for redistricting. As you've heard already, there are many  
15 possible outcomes and many possible barriers that we can put between our districts that make  
16 sense and achieve these objectives. We asked the commissioners to look at other alternatives, one  
17 of which is presented here. Earlier this week, we hired a GIS census expert and she spent 10 hours  
18 using Mr. De Grandy's work, making adjustments, but then reaching back to figure out what were  
19 the ways in which we could, as a city of Miami, exploit a rare opportunity here. An opportunity to  
20 reunite communities that had been previously split by other actions. Uh, Mr. Gonzalez just  
21 explained one here, we have the opportunity to reunite neighborhoods, preserve communities of  
22 interest in the interests of those communities, simplify your burden of communicating and  
23 leadership, simplify the burdens of civic leaders as they try to communicate with multiple

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 commissioners and anticipate the growth. This is only one presented map that shows this, but it's  
2 interesting to note that by doing so, using our understanding Mr. De Grandy's guidance, the  
3 variation associated with this is far less than the one he presented today. Many other alternatives  
4 are available and I'll turn it over to my colleague here to present one.

5 Chris Baraloto: Good afternoon, everyone Chris Baraloto, 3752 Kumquat Avenue in  
6 Coconut Grove District 2. I'm here as a citizen, as a member of the Coconut Grove Village  
7 Council, and above all, as a scientist. And as a scientist, I empathize with the challenges faced by  
8 Mr. De Grandy and his colleagues in putting together these maps and two points I really want to  
9 make for us all to understand. First of all, these are challenges admitted as such and so why are we  
10 rushing to confront these challenges? There's no need for us to rush through this process, given all  
11 of the challenges in putting together this information. The second piece, as a scientist, involves  
12 peer review, peer review by the public peer review in terms of input, and we haven't had that  
13 opportunity. We were told in the last meeting that no decisions would be made, and yet decisions  
14 were made to give instructions to Mr. De Grandy and others. We have before us alternatives that  
15 the citizenry came up with on their own that come before us as examples and there exist dozens of  
16 these examples as alternatives that should be considered as alternatives before any decisions are  
17 made. So let's not have puppet meetings next week and the week beyond in which were informed  
18 of a plan. Let's rather have meetings in which we give peer review and it's taken into consideration  
19 such as this one, thank you.

20 Commissioner King: Good afternoon.

21 Joseph Brown: Good afternoon I am also a Coconut Grove Village Councilman, my name  
22 is Joseph Brown, I live in the West Grove. I just wanted to take a moment to reflect on  
23 Commissioner Reyes' prayer that we consider those less fortunate and then we say the Pledge of



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Allegiance, in the Pledge of Allegiance said justice for all. Almost 100 years, the West Grove has  
2 been neglected, redlined, abused. We all know, all the commissioners, Mr. Russell, along with  
3 someone over and above the others before, know that this has been happening. There is a crisis  
4 that we're in the midst of right now with this redistricting and in the Chinese language, the word  
5 crisis means danger, but it also means opportunity. So I hope that this crisis will let the  
6 commissioners reflect and reconsider breaking up the Grove at all. There's a great culture that  
7 exhibits and lives here in the Grove. We need to keep that culture together, we're stronger together  
8 than we are apart. This crisis has also brought stakeholders out from many different communities,  
9 many different organizations and now we stand a one, one voice. I'm hoping that we can stop the  
10 disenfranchisement. I'm hoping that right now, there's always unintended consequences that exist  
11 with any decision that's made, we all know that. So today, due process is super important. Due  
12 process can't be done. The residents of Coconut Grove feel like this cake has been baked and that  
13 we're being informed. We hope that the commissioners do not bake the cake without due process  
14 of the residents and consider leaving the Grove's culture intact. We're one Grove, one people, and  
15 one great community. Thank you.

16 Commissioner King: Thank you.

17 Swaitha Genampoly: Good afternoon um my name is Swaitha Genampoly of 3003 Matilda  
18 Street, and I'm a resident of District 2. I'd like to enter into the public record this petition and  
19 specifically a copy of this petition and the comments to each member of the Commission.  
20 Signatories of this petition stand against the redistricting and Coconut Grove of Coconut Grove  
21 and in strong unity for one Grove. We are against the separation, division, reduction of history and  
22 diversity of the Grove. We stand against decision making in the dark and we will be staying strong  
23 24/7 every day until March 11 and thereafter. 1,592 people have signed this petition and that's

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 only since yesterday. By the March 11th vote, there will be over 15,000 signatures. So I'd like to  
2 enter this petition and the comments that each member of the Commission into the public record.

3 Commissioner King : Thank you. Sir?

4 Steven Dloogoff: Steven Dloogoff, member living in Coconut Grove for 30 years now at  
5 3418 Franklin Avenue, past member of the Coconut Grove Village Council and a homeowners  
6 association president. This morning, we had the opportunity to speak with Christina White, who  
7 is the supervisor of elections for Miami-Dade. She said March 11th, redistricting is not a hard and  
8 fast deadline, March 11th is only a goal. We could easily wait until next year and any penalty  
9 would be well worth it. Thank you.

10 Commissioner King: Thank you. Thank you, Ma'am?

11 Lynn Fecteau: Yes okay. Good afternoon. My name is Lynn Fecteau, I live at 2542  
12 Swanson Avenue at 33133. I have lived in historic Coconut Grove for 46 years and I have owned  
13 my home for 35 of those 46 years. I'm an artist and I've been here long enough that I painted the  
14 poster in a Coconut Grove Art Festival in 1996. Although it's hard to believe I also am a member  
15 of the oldest woman's club in the state of Florida, which is the Woman's Club of Coconut Grove.  
16 I care deeply about our diverse community and our historic village. Coconut Grove is the oldest  
17 permanent settlement in Miami-Dade. In 1919, it became its own city, but was annexed by the city  
18 of Miami in 1925. I oppose all changes to our boundaries, it divides our unified neighborhoods  
19 and civic organizations, in other words, changing the boundaries divides and makes us weaker. In  
20 my mind, it sounds like gerrymandering. The definition for gerrymandering is political  
21 manipulation of electoral district boundaries with the intent of creating undue advantage for a  
22 party, group or socio-economic class. Please do not break up historic Coconut Grove. The Grove  
23 is just fine the way it is, one Grove. I am going to vote for commissioners that support one Grove.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Thank you very much.

2 Commissioner King: Thank you, good afternoon?

3 David Collins: Good afternoon. I think I'm on. Yes, yes respectfully, commissioners, it's  
4 an honor to speak to you again. My name is David Collins, 3230 Clifford Lane, Miami, Florida.  
5 We're having a huge arts festival on March 6th, if you want to see what's the Grove about, please  
6 attend, 12 to 5. If you want more details, I'll provide them to you. In I believe it was 1925, after  
7 Miami changed the law to allow downtown to vote on the annexation of Coconut Grove. They sent  
8 a representative to a member of the town of Coconut Grove, official town of Coconut Grove, and  
9 said, we want to inform you that the city of Miami is considering annexing Coconut Grove and the  
10 member of the town council in Coconut Grove replied, that's really unusual because in our last  
11 meeting we discussed the possibility of annexing the city of Miami. I think it's important to  
12 remember this is a really valuable point for you as commissioners, and I know you do a lot of  
13 things, but please recognize the opportunity. The opportunity here is to work with the Grove, we've  
14 paid as citizens for different studies which have come up with alternative redistricting. We don't  
15 mind redistricting, what we ask you to observe is the primary mandate in the redistricting advice  
16 to cities, which is do not destroy or disrupt traditional communities. We are your friends. Please  
17 allow us, as the oldest community in Miami, to continue to exist. Thank you.

18 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

19 Yanelis Valdes: Good afternoon. My name is Yanelis Valdes and I'm a District 2 resident  
20 living at 58 NE 14th Street. I stand in solidarity with my fellow District 2 residents from Coconut  
21 Grove, uplifting the harm that splitting the neighborhood will have on our community as a whole.  
22 In addition to being a concerned resident, I work with Engage Miami, a non-profit dedicated to  
23 civic engagement and education. We believe that government transparency and community input

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 is imperative for these types of decisions. It is critical to have a conversation and allow room for  
2 questions and dialog with residents so we can fully understand the impact of changes on our  
3 communities. I appreciate the mention that some of these meetings are already taking place,  
4 however, we as an organization follow this process very carefully and we've actually not been  
5 aware of the community meetings that have happened, which is really unfortunate because we try  
6 to get our members, many young people across the city, many who are in District 5, for example,  
7 and unfortunately cannot have the space to share. I reached out to each of you via email to ask that  
8 you carefully plan these district-specific meetings to speak with each of your constituents. I believe  
9 that the following is imperative: please publicize date, time and location of meetings widely at  
10 least a week in advance. Connect to community organizations in the district to co-host a meeting  
11 and help spread the word. Make phone calls, knock on doors and send notices in the mail to all  
12 residents. Post fliers with meeting information in local businesses that people frequent like  
13 restaurants, grocery stores, coffee shops. Post on social media and send emails through listservs  
14 accessible to your office. I also want to mention that it's hard for people to come out here in the  
15 middle of the day, especially young people who are in school or who are working. So want to make  
16 sure that these events are made in a time that's helpful for folks in the evenings and in the weekend.  
17 Like others have mentioned, we have time, so please take your time and planning and please,  
18 please don't rush this process. Thank you.

19 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

20 Timothy Mclemore: Good afternoon. First, I would like to say thank you for serving the  
21 city of Miami. My name is Timothy Mclemore, I live 2900 SW 28th Lane, a new member to  
22 Coconut Grove but I've always admired this city. There's a saying that goes, if it's not broke, don't  
23 fix it and Coconut Grove is surely not broken. We're very healthy and happy and thriving, and it

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 would be a shame to see the city be split. Thank you.

2 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

3 Cynthia Shelley: Hey there. My name is Cynthia Shelley and I have been a homeowner in  
4 Coconut Grove, Florida, for 40 years, 2975 Washington Street. On a patriotic note, my father was  
5 a squadron leader and flew 50 missions over occupied Europe in World War Two, he risked his  
6 life to serve the people of the world. And not a lesser known but as important, I am a civic  
7 representative, I have been for 40 years I've stood here before the commission pregnant, holding  
8 baby in my arms, holding another baby in my arms. My children grew up here. They're very  
9 comfortable at City Hall. I am a past vice president of the PTA of Coconut Grove Elementary. I  
10 am a founder and past vice president of the Coconut Grove Park Homeowners Association and a  
11 founder of the Village Council. I'm a past vice president and largest of the largest representation  
12 representational club for Coconut Grove called the Civic Club. Currently, I'm on the executive  
13 board as a member of the Coconut Grove Park Homeowners Association. My own homeowner's  
14 association. My service to the village of Coconut Grove has a long history we and I'm representing  
15 many of those entities that I just announced do not want to see Coconut Grove chopped and  
16 divided. And people who have been represented misrepresented in one body left to a zone which  
17 does not understand the needs of their community. I'm speaking on behalf of the community of  
18 West Grove we were founded as a village, and we want to keep it that way not divided not divided  
19 into many zones who are represented by two, three or more commissioners. As a well-known  
20 representative —

21 Commissioner King: Thank you.

22 Cynthia Shelley: Thank you.

23 Commissioner King: Good afternoon.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Paula Rekalores: Good afternoon. My name is Paula Rekalores I live in Shenandoah. I am  
2 here as a resident. I am here to ask that when or if redistricting is necessary, that the premise and  
3 criteria for doing so protects neighborhoods from being divided or split into more than one  
4 commission or district. Shenandoah has characteristics that are special, like many other  
5 neighborhoods that define it, and being harmonious homogeneity community having one  
6 commissioner helps in keeping that. It is better for consistency and for process. I am not opposing  
7 redistricting if this is what is necessary. But I do ask that neighborhoods are not split, that outreach  
8 is done, and that the process of design and decision making is granted the time and the study that  
9 it needs and merits. It should not be rushed. These decisions will affect our lives and our livelihood.  
10 Thank you so much for your time.

11 Commissioner King: Thank you.

12 Commissioner Carollo: Shenandoah are you in 3 or 4?

13 Paula Rekalores: I'm in 4. My mother is in 4. My father is in 3, I'm in 4.

14 Commissioner Carollo: Are you well represented?

15 Paula Rekalores: I'm sorry.

16 Commissioner Carollo: Are you well represented?

17 Paula Rekalores: Very well represented, thank you.

18 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you very much.

19 Paula Rekalores: Thank you.

20 Commissioner King: Good afternoon?

21 Lisa Remeny: Good afternoon I'm Lisa Remeny, Miami native and spent my first years as  
22 a young adult in Coconut Grove, I will simply say.

23 Commissioner King: Your address please, ma'am?

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Lisa Remeny: Poinciana Avenue 3950, I vehemently oppose this redistricting I wish you  
2 would all please reconsider. Keep our community as one, thank you.

3 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

4 Willie Allen-Faiella: Good afternoon I'm Willie Allen-Faiella, Director of St Stephen's  
5 Episcopal Church, 2750 McFarland Road in Coconut Grove. I am also on the pastor's board of the  
6 Coconut Grove Ministerial Alliance and I'm also a member of my church, is also a member of  
7 GRACE, Grove Rights and Community Equity. I was here two weeks ago at the first hearing. This  
8 room was packed and it was packed with people who were speaking on behalf of keeping the  
9 Grove unified. I'm here again today, this group, this room is packed once again with people  
10 speaking on behalf of keeping one Grove. With all due respect to the other areas, the other districts  
11 in our city, I don't see anybody here with the kind of dedication, passion, commitment, willing to  
12 give up work time, school time, money to make something happen, which is to keep our Grove  
13 unified. I see Black people, I see white people, I see Hispanic people who often are not coming  
14 together for a common cause, but this is so important that we have come together. And I would  
15 say that members, people, residents of the West Grove, who have historically, over the years, as  
16 people have already said, been redlined, been – been denied their equal rights, which is what  
17 GRACE fights for, are here today to support the unity of the Grove. Even though, yes, much of  
18 the West Grove will remain intact. My brothers and sister from Coconut – from the Village West  
19 are here in support of keeping it one Grove I love the whole city I respect all your districts, but  
20 only district troop 2 to has this kind of turnout to show this kind of unity for a historic part of our  
21 city that we love and we'll fight for, Thank you.

22 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

23 Abigail Apé: Hi. Good afternoon. My name is Abigail Apé, I am a resident of District 2

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 for 13 years now. I reside at 1700 Bayshore Drive. But I also work with the residents of Brickell  
2 through the Brickell Homeowners Association, which has 35 towers here in our community. I do  
3 not envy your role, I know that you have a hard job ahead of you, you have a lot of different voices,  
4 a lot of different residents here to express themselves and so I'm here to express myself on behalf  
5 of the residents of Brickell, as well as Downtown. I think that the deadline for March 11 is too  
6 soon, and I think that we need to find a creative way to keep neighborhoods united, such as  
7 Downtown, Brickell and the Grove. I do not have a solution for you, but I do have my voice, and  
8 so I'm here to advocate on behalf of my neighborhood and here to to be an advocate for those who  
9 cannot physically make it. And so I just want to say thank you for your service and I hope that  
10 we're able to come to a unified front and as I mentioned, I'm here to serve our community so  
11 please use me and our association as well as our community. Thank you.

12 Commissioner King: Thank you.

13 Elvis Cruz: Good afternoon, commissioners. Elvis Cruz, 631 NE 57th Street. I live in the  
14 Morningside neighborhood, which is about as far away from Coconut Grove as you can get in  
15 District 2. But today I'm here in support of my good friends and neighbours in Coconut Grove and  
16 their efforts to stay together in one district. I've looked at the alternative plan that was put forth by  
17 the neighbours, and I found it very plausible and credible. I'm not going to go into the reasons why  
18 the Grove should stay together. You've heard that many times already and so to avoid being  
19 redundant and saving a lot of time, I thought we might try asking the question in reverse. Is there  
20 anybody here in favor of splitting Coconut Grove? So for the record, I don't see a single hand  
21 raised. Thank you so much and I'd like to reserve the rest of my time for the next City Commission  
22 meeting.

23 Commissioner King: No.



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Penny Tannenbaum: Hello. My name is Penny Tannenbaum, I'm here representing myself  
2 and my daughter, who I am the guardian for. I live at 1826 Fairhaven Place Miami so that is in  
3 District 2. My daughter lives in Silver Bluffs and she has a disability, I walk from my house to her  
4 house every day. I walk through the Ridge area and I'm like kind of shocked that that would not  
5 be part of the Grove. I can see the differences of what our communities need. I think we need to  
6 continue to have a voice. I moved to the Grove because it was socially diverse, we were presented  
7 with continuing use of we have to have cohesion in how we divide our neighborhood, how we  
8 redistrict well, cohesion to me and I think to a lot of people here in in the Grove means keeping all  
9 this community spirit that you see here today. The economic diversity, that the ethnic diversity,  
10 the racial diversity. That's cohesion to me, where the cohesion that we continue to be, you seem  
11 to be pointing at something else other than our our cohesion. I look at the Grove we need big issues  
12 for us are sea level rise, keeping our tree canopy, having affordable housing for both low income  
13 and workforce housing. I would say in my daughter's district, it's adding trees. It's like a desert  
14 there, so the needs are really different and I appreciate that you made a bunch of changes, but I  
15 support what most people here do.

16 Commissioner Carollo: You have 10 seconds left, ma'am.

17 Penny Tannenbaum: Okay, to keep the Grove together, keep us all cohesive and let us be  
18 continue to be activists in the city of Miami, Thank you.

19 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you, Sir?

20 Joey Francilus: Hi, my name is Joy Francilus, I'm here representing the ACLU of Florida.  
21 Earlier today —

22 Commissioner Carollo: Are you a uh city resident?

23 Joey Francilus: I am representing the ACLU of Florida, which is in the city of Miami.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Commissioner Carollo: But that's not the question that I made.

2 Joey Francilus: I am not a resident, I here am representing the ACLU of Florida.

3 Commissioner Carollo: Okay.

4 Joey Francilus: Earlier today, we emailed the Commission a letter raising several concerns  
5 about your redistricting process. We hope we can – that we can clarify the city's obligation and  
6 opportunities with respect to these issues. First, districts must respect the Constitution's prohibition  
7 on racial gerrymandering. The Commission is barred from adopting arbitrary numerical  
8 demographic targets when fashioning districts. Commissioners have previously discussed a target  
9 of 50% Black population for District 5. Such as – such a numerical target divorced from any actual  
10 analysis is – is necessary to afford Black voters an opportunity to elect preferred candidates raises  
11 – raises equal protection concerns – raised concerns. Furthermore, over concentrating Black voters  
12 in District 5 may constitute unlawful packing. Our letter highlights some key statistics that are  
13 relevant to District 5's legal compliance. We urge you to take the full breadth of available data  
14 into account rather than looking into merely at surface – at surface-level census population totals.  
15 Secondly, we have noticed some discrepancies in the population figures presented to you at – at  
16 previous meetings. Numbers in Mr. De Grandy's presentation do not all add up to the reported  
17 census totals, giving an incorrect picture of the population equality of the five districts. Moreover,  
18 proposed plans Mr. Grandy drafted have included precincts that are outside the city of Miami. You  
19 must take care that you use the accurate and official census figures and do not include populations  
20 outside the city. Finally, we stand in solidarity with the residents of the West Grove neighborhood  
21 who have expressed their concerns about being moved out of District 2. Fixing the first two issues  
22 we are – we – fixing the first two issues we raise gives the city an opportunity to accommodate the  
23 West Grove residents' goals.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Commissioner Carollo: You got 5 seconds.

2 Joey Francilus: If you have any other and have any questions, please contact the note,  
3 people noted on the letter, thank you.

4 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you, ma'am. 2 minutes.

5 Jessica Saint-fleur: Hello. My name is Jessica Saint-fleur, I live at 155 NW 64th Street,  
6 Miami, Florida in District 5. It makes no sense to further segregate the historically Black  
7 community of the West Grove, intentionally reducing the racial diversity that the community has  
8 fought so hard to dismantle and erase the very facets that make Miami the diversity that we are  
9 proud of. 497 to 114 Black people, does that sound historical or very much Black to you? You  
10 want to increase the voting power of Black communities in one district that is significantly already  
11 Black, that has been voting for Black officials for many years, to get that one Black chair in this  
12 commission. So what is the point of moving people around when they will only get more confused  
13 on who their commissioners are? So as an educator of local civics in the area, it's a huge problem  
14 when it comes Election Day and everyone is wondering why no one showed up. Therefore, you're  
15 trying to increase the voter population, but what about actual voter engagement? Just because they  
16 are not considered another district doesn't mean that they're going to have the knowledge that they  
17 need to go vote. The – you will be changing their voting habits. You will be changing the years in  
18 which they vote. The community in which they have gathered for political actions have now  
19 changed. So we want you to think about the implications more and consider the community input  
20 so that we can further make this a participatory process and not just when elected officials can  
21 make these decisions on their own. Thank you.

22 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you, ma'am.

23 Cecilia Kurland: Good afternoon, Commissioners, and thank you for your service and time

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 and to the staff. My name is Cecilia Kurland, and I live a 3231 Day Avenue, which is in Coconut  
2 Grove. I would like to read you the definition of Coconut Grove from Wikipedia. Coconut Grove,  
3 also known as the Grove, is the oldest continuously inhabited neighborhood of Miami in Miami-  
4 Dade County. Please respect history. This is one of the oldest neighborhoods in Miami, and this  
5 comes as this community was founded, like in 1970, 1873 we have seen the historical map already  
6 with the boundaries. So I would like to request to keep it simple and the boundaries out there and  
7 maybe incorporate what is now coming up that you mentioned so many projects that are being  
8 finished and occupied, very soon. Thank you for your time.

9 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you, Ma'am?

10 Rita Dever: Hi. My name is Rita Dever, I live at 1155 Brickell Bay Drive, and I'm in  
11 District 2 and I want to applaud one Grove, one of the favorite places to go, but also for Brickell  
12 I'm very much opposed to this redistricting plan as it sits. Obviously no one wants to be split up,  
13 but Brickell going into three different slivers, I'm hoping that you'll consider the alternatives  
14 obviously, the density of Brickell isn't a surprise, so why not have more commissioners? Why not  
15 take it to the ballot box, why not have a different plan and allow us to have a voice. I want to reedit  
16 reiterate what has already been so eloquently said. Please don't rush the process.

17 Commissioner Carollo: Rita do you have a twin that lives in Center Grove?

18 Rita Dever: Pardon me?

19 Commissioner Carollo: Do you have a twin that lives in Centre Grove?

20 Rita Dever: No.

21 Commissioner Carollo: Yes, that lady over there that looks just like you.

22 Rita Dever: My doppelganger?

23 Commissioner Carollo : Yeah.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Rita Dever: Thank you.

2 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you for coming.

3 Commissioner King: Good afternoon.

4 Chuck Walter: Hi. My name is Chuck Walter, I live at 1901 Brickell Avenue and I want to  
5 echo some of the sentiments spoken earlier about civic engagement. I stand here and I am amazed  
6 and I'm jealous of of the advocacy by Coconut Grove residents and I wish that we had that level  
7 of engagement for all of Miami. And I think that the the natural geographic region of the Grove  
8 has has helped them be able to form that community so the notion that we should we should be  
9 looking at how do we increase civic engagement throughout our city. And I think that comes by  
10 looking at defining natural boundaries, not splitting streets and avenues. Maybe there are things  
11 like the Metrorail and the Florida East Coast rail line that we could be looking at I think right now  
12 in the maps, Mr. De Grandy, we have streets and avenues as more so the definition. But the Florida  
13 East Coast rail line could be a very clear way for residents to be able to see whether they're in 2  
14 or 5 and then looking at what street we need to go up to and then up to that point becomes District  
15 2 and then District 5 can be adjusted, District 1 can be adjusted and you can we can look at some  
16 small adjustments to, 3 and 4. Ideally with the eyes of keeping neighborhoods together. But our  
17 goal here should be to find the same civic engagement that we see from Grove residents. Because  
18 that will mean a richer, better experience for for Miami going into our future. Thank you.

19 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

20 Jonathan Goldberg: Hi, good afternoon. My name is Jonathan Goldberg, 495 Brickell  
21 Avenue, I'm a resident of District 2. I support the preserving of all communities. I'm a resident of  
22 Brickell and would implore you to focus on the preservation of our community of Brickell and  
23 Downtown as well. The current proposed lines would diminish our voices and remove a part of

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 our community. Thank you for your time and service.

2 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon how are you?

3 Juan Marcos: Good afternoon. My name is Juan Marcos, I live at 117 SW 10th Street with  
4 these three residents but I live on the border right next to our district, to the Brickell area. I run  
5 Brickell's largest community platform, is called Brickell Living, we have 134,000 followers on  
6 Instagram and 11,000 vetted Facebook group members. Because of our reach, we consider  
7 ourselves the digital voice of the Brickell community. At one of these redistricting meetings, it  
8 was suggested to potentially split Brickell down South Miami Avenue in order to keep other  
9 neighborhoods intact. When we presented this to our community every single member voiced  
10 strong concerns, we deeply feel that Brickell is one community. The residents of this neighborhood  
11 have similar needs and face similar struggles we are one unified community and as such, we should  
12 stay together in one district we're asking to the City Commissioners that if they can't find a  
13 solution to keep unified neighborhoods together, including but not limited to Brickell, Downtown  
14 Miami and the Grove in the March 11th vote on this issue should be postponed until we come up  
15 with a solution that actually benefits city of Miami residents. Thank you.

16 Marci Weber: Hi. My name is Marci Weber, 2525 Swanson Avenue in the Grove and I've  
17 lived here for almost 20 years now. I love it here, I've spoken at many meetings on many different  
18 issues however, this one is very, very dear to me, and it's the reason that I stayed here from New  
19 York was because I loved the Grove. And as I've said before, and I know we have support of our  
20 commissioner of District 2, so I thank you for paying so much attention to this, I wish the other  
21 two commissioners were here and I hope they hear what we all have to say in their absence. We  
22 beseech you to please work with us on finding a different solution. Commissioner Corollo,  
23 Commissioner King and our two, two other commissioners, please understand our passion. I know

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 I'm not the only I listen to my neighbours here and we're so different we are the jewel of one of  
2 the jewels of Miami we have many jewels in Miami. But Coconut Grove has enabled other  
3 neighborhoods to thrive with all the beautiful development that's happened here and the growth of  
4 the Grove and the businesses that are coming and the tourists and it's bringing, it's bringing home  
5 prices up in Shenandoah, in Silver Bluff, in Little Havana. I drive through Little Havana now I  
6 cannot believe it's the same place that I moved here, it's so gorgeous, it's Silver Bluffs, gorgeous  
7 and everyone is profiting and benefiting and thriving from this from this little Grove. I beseech  
8 you to let us be the model of of bringing people together. Commissioner Carollo, I know you have  
9 such strong opinions and you're so influential I beseech you to please help us find another solution  
10 and also to you, Commissioner King, and to our missing other commissioners. But I know they'll  
11 hear what we have to say. Thank you so much.

12 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you. Thank you, ma'am. But I'm not as influential as you  
13 might think.

14 Female Speaker: I just wanted to let everybody know that we have surround sound here so  
15 all of the commissioners can hear through the back and in the bathrooms so just so that, you know.

16 Commissioner King: Thank you, good afternoon how are you?

17 Patrick Hourani: Hello. My name is Dr. Patrick Hourani I'm the chair of Internal Medicine  
18 at Mercy Hospital. I'm 40 years old and I've lived in Miami all my life. This is my first meeting  
19 hearing that I've come out to because it seems so compelling as an existential crisis facing the  
20 Grove and strongly opposed to splitting the Grove. I share her sentiments, really her emotion in  
21 terms of living in the Grove and I think that I've felt that way all my life I worked till I was about  
22 38 to be able to live, to move to the Grove and now, now that I'm here, it's just a dream. And and  
23 I'm so reassured to see that people who have been here much longer than I have I feel the same

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 way and maybe I'll feel that way, too, when I get older and I hope that therefore the community  
2 can be preserved for that long. And it's also really reassuring to see that people from different  
3 backgrounds that in other parts of Miami or the country might feel that they have competing  
4 interests and can come together for this community so it must be worth something. Thank you.

5 Commissioner Carollo: Hold on for a minute sir, chair, can I indulge you in letting me ask  
6 just a brief show of hands, then a question that I want to ask.

7 Commissioner King: Sure, go ahead.

8 Commissioner Carollo: How many of the Grove residents that are here have lived in the  
9 Grove for 40 years or more? I could see a show of hands. Okay, one, two so approximately 20 that  
10 are here, how many have lived in the Grove for, you know, 30 years to 40 years. We got six, seven  
11 okay, how many have lived in the Grove between 20 to 30 years. Another 10 or so, okay. Thank  
12 you.

13 Commissioner King: Sir.

14 Marcela Fernandez: Good afternoon. Marcela Fernandez, 3936 Main Highway as my  
15 business, 3637 Charles Avenue is my residence, a former Coconut Grove Village Council member  
16 and chair. And we've got to cut to the chase right, all this fluff, we know redistricting is needed,  
17 we know redistricting is what needs to be done to comply with all voting and democracy. But what  
18 we've done, what we've seen here has not been the real purpose for it. Commissioner Carollo, I  
19 know Commissioner Reyes, de la Portilla to do the right thing. There are many alternatives here  
20 to do the right thing and to do the democratic thing to do here and there's alternatives. I'm sure the  
21 attorneys can sit down and show you other plans that will work perfectly well with all the  
22 compliance. You'll have all these people go away and we'll do what's right so please, we only  
23 need a few votes and obviously the Commissioner Russell is also one of the one keeps the Grove.



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 You guys talk and this can go away in a matter of hours and do the right thing and the democratic  
2 things right to do, you know what it is, thank you very much.

3 Commissioner King: Thank you.

4 Clarice Cooper: Good afternoon. My name is Clarice Cooper. My address is 3735 Oak  
5 Avenue in Coconut Grove, I'm here on behalf of the Coconut Grove Village West Homeowners  
6 and Tenants Association, on which I am the president. I'm here to restate our opposition to the  
7 redistricting plan that's been presented before and the newly revised one, especially as it affects  
8 the truncation of Coconut Grove. We as the oldest community, we need to stay intact. We've  
9 worked together, our different neighborhoods through the years and we have done this even though  
10 we cross the racial, economic and cultural differences, that we have we crossed those lines and we  
11 managed to work together. We did get to resolve have resolved some of our issues right here in  
12 this chamber by working together and it's very important that we do stay together as one Grove in  
13 one district. And I hope that's kept in mind when you decide that you're going to vote on this, for  
14 us to have to live with for another 10 years, and we do hope that you take that into consideration.  
15 Thank you.

16 Commissioner Carollo: It looks like eight, we two years behind, more or less. Thank you.

17 Clarice Cooper: Thank you.

18 Commissioner King: Good afternoon?

19 Josh Abril: Hi, Josh Abril, 3081 Oak Avenue, I've been living in the Grove 13 years, grew  
20 up down south and now west. The family's lived in District 3 since they got here in 1960, and they  
21 still do. My dad's still living in the house that they moved into when they got here. I've seen  
22 changes all over the city either I mean, we all have, especially over the last couple of years. But I  
23 think one of the biggest reasons why we see such a big Grove turnout is because I think there's a

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 bit of a sentiment that we're being punished for population explosions that are happening in other  
2 parts of the district. And so I understand I mean, I still counted my fingers I can only imagine what  
3 Mr. Legrand is going through, but with three commissioners, with all the complications that have  
4 been mentioned, my biggest concern right now is the newly formed CRA that has yet to really go  
5 into effect. With its main economic hub being it will be redistricted and how those complications  
6 will apply to that and and West Grove. You know, furthermore in relation to that. So with that in  
7 mind with different organizations in mind and the complications that 3 commissioners will impose  
8 on the Grove, I want to I want to reiterate the emphasis that we want that we would love to see a  
9 little more time being taken to really can take those sorts of things into consideration. Thank you  
10 very much.

11 Commissioner King: Good afternoon?

12 George Simpson: My name is George Simpson I live at 3801 Thomas Avenue. My great  
13 grandfather W.F. Stirrup when he died, 1957 he had 199 properties in Coconut Grove. The one  
14 property he had outside of the Grove was a building he built at the corner of 8th Street, Third  
15 Avenue Overtown, because when my mother was eight years old, she said she wanted to be a  
16 doctor and he said, I'll build a building where you'll have your office and that's where she  
17 practiced until 95 decimated the Overtown neighborhood. Now, I grew up and went to high school  
18 in Miami, I lived at the Stirrup house when I was a child, but I then I went to school in Atlanta,  
19 Nashville, Boston, and worked in Chicago, New York before going overseas. One thing that I  
20 found in common was whenever a particular ethnic neighborhood got too powerful, you start  
21 hearing redistricting and we start hearing about consultants and whatnot. So my experience has  
22 been when we hear this type of language, it's generally to dilute an ethnic group in a particular  
23 neighborhood regardless of what the ethnic group is. So one of the things my great grandfather

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 said as he was dying was beware when they start changing the zoning, which is in effect,  
2 redistricting. So leave the Grove as it has been since the 1880s. Thank you.

3 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

4 Albert Gomez: Good afternoon, Albert Gomez, 3566 Vista Court, a proud resident of  
5 Miami, Coconut Grove District 2. I would say that I've set on the sea level rise committee at one  
6 time, and we were bringing in some money, you know, CRA the whole thing, really trying to make  
7 us get real with our threats and vulnerabilities down here. And there was a direct fear that we  
8 needed to do it right, because we're going to move a lot of money and we were going to second  
9 the general obligation bond, so we really engaged the community. We did workshops, announced  
10 it, use multimedia, a broad array of tools to really get the word out so that we can get maximum  
11 community engagement. Those are examples of proper community engagement. There is no  
12 deadline here. This is all an opportunity a problem is nothing but an opportunity. The problem is  
13 District 2 is over populated. Let's work with the community to figure it out. I am a Grove resident  
14 I also am on the UN Advisory Board, the Chaplains Council I I founded the Bahamas Interfaith  
15 Alliance, I work with the Bahamian churches that are in West Grove and churches in the Bahamas.  
16 And I can tell you right now, they all talk about the Grove as truly being one and I my church is  
17 Christ Episcopal in the West Grove, right there on the border and we help West Village residents.  
18 That is my experience. That can't be taken away. That's what I'm fighting for I want you to honor  
19 that, the fact that we have cohesion across economic barriers. You know, there are certain people  
20 don't have opportunities ,West Grove and certain areas of the Grove were blighted, and they were  
21 blighted from past negative things that were done to it, whether it be prospecting or what have you  
22 we have an opportunity to take advantage of our citizens.

23 Commissioner King: Thank you, thank you.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Jerry Schuman: Afternoon. Jerry Schuman, 2926 SW 30th Court, Coconut Grove. I've  
2 been here almost 60 years. 50 years in the same street. The district is going to go into District 4,  
3 which is my district where I'm living, and we strongly oppose, and all the neighbors who live in  
4 the area strongly oppose, and as you can see, this is all about one Grove. We all oppose, so we just  
5 ask you to please look at this again. Doesn't need to be rushed, US 1 is the obvious border. Take  
6 a look at it again. Thank you for your time. Thank you, Mr. Carollo.

7 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you.

8 Commissioner King: Good afternoon.

9 Franck Dossa: Yes, hello. My name is Franck Dossa, I am from 950 Brickell Bay Drive  
10 and I am bringing another dissenting voice to redistricting, coming from Brickell. I am very jealous  
11 of Coconut Grove, which is a beautiful neighborhood, and they are having such a mobilization  
12 here to save a neighborhood and it need to be saved, we need to stay one. The same thing is also  
13 in Brickell. Brickell is one community, we are facing the same issues, we are a highly walkable  
14 community where we constantly do things, work, working. There is no sense in splitting Brickell  
15 between different districts. We are already quite neglected as a – as a district, as an area, and we  
16 should be actually better treated and we should – we should have only one, one commissioner, we  
17 should be in one district. Now. District 2 obviously is getting bigger and bigger and it is just like  
18 too spread, I mean; it's going from Coconut Grove all the way to Morningside. These people have  
19 differing needs. These people have different communities, different way of life, and it should be  
20 treated differently, uh, I'm going to finish with a suggestion to the commission: if you are going  
21 to enforce the two minutes rule, then it would be nice to invest in a timer so when somebody is  
22 talking, he knows that we don't have to give too much time. This redistricting thing is extremely  
23 important for Miami. Take your time, instead of playing with numbers, ask these people, this

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 consultant, to play with communities. They should see the different communities in Miami and  
2 find the district that will respect the border of these communities and make sense. The rest doesn't  
3 make sense to split people because you're going to move 100 people to from this place to another  
4 place. In my building, we have 2500 building person and I'm a vice president of a condo, we  
5 cannot move people from one side to another side, it has to be done better things.

6 Commissioner King: Thank you.

7 Franck Dossa: 1:57.

8 Commissioner King: I have a timer here so for those of you who weren't aware, I have a  
9 timer here. The first bell you hear, you have 30 seconds left to speak, the second bell you hear,  
10 your time is up so we are monitoring the time. Thank you. Good afternoon.

11 Katrina Morris: Good afternoon. Katrina Morris, 4130 Lybyer Avenue, District 2. I'm  
12 opposed to the current redistricting plan, it breaks up the traditional neighborhood of Coconut  
13 Grove unnecessarily. Furthermore, the public was not given the opportunity to see alternative  
14 plans, nor were they given any workshops or a chance to engage in the dialog with the public, staff  
15 or officials before the single draft plan was presented to them February 7th. This is a blatant  
16 disenfranchisement of the constituents of the city of Miami. After reviewing the commissioners'  
17 statements, it is clear that the intent of Commissioners Díaz de la Portilla, Reyes and Carollo  
18 appears to be to break up the Coconut Grove voting bloc. They gave the directive to preserve  
19 preserve existing neighborhoods when, uh time, but continue to say where feasible when given  
20 examples of neighborhoods that should be kept together. They gave Allapattah, Flagami,  
21 Wynwood and Overtown as examples as examples of what to break up hypothetically, they were  
22 turned over and over to the Grove why? Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla said he wanted to see,  
23 "How far De Grandy could go and still defend it in a courtroom." On November 18th,

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla suggested they have one meeting on December 5th and then have  
2 a beautiful Christmas and then come back maybe in February he said he wasn't there yet. On  
3 December 5th, De Grandy stated that the purpose of the meeting was to get addition on December  
4 5th to get additional directions from the commissioners and had nothing to show them. Raleigh,  
5 North Carolina with a population of 464,000 and 5 districts started the process with the same  
6 census on November 2nd, offered three options to residents, had at least two public study groups  
7 and 4 community meetings regarding the plan, all by February 23rd, 2022. On December 9th, no  
8 new criteria were added, but the desire to break up Coconut Grove was reiterated why?  
9 Governments, the Declaration of Independence states, derive their just powers from the consent of  
10 the governed, thank you and I'm submitting,

11 Commissioner King: Thank you

12 Katrina Morris: Sure and I'm submitting Raleigh's –

13 Commissioner King: Good afternoon, how are you?

14 John Snyder (Resident): Yes. John Snyder, 3980 Hardie Avenue. I'm representing the  
15 South Grove Neighborhood Association, of which I'm the president. We are opposed to this  
16 redistricting plan, we think there are better alternatives. I think 2 of them have been presented  
17 today, 1 of them even reunites an additional neighborhood, it's very important to have  
18 neighborhoods. Ours is one which is diverse, both in terms of racial makeup, ethnic makeup, they  
19 even let a German in there like me. Uh and they're also economically, so demographically,  
20 ethnically we operate as one neighborhood, we've we've seen that there are better alternatives in  
21 addition, the constraints that Mr. De Grandy mentioned, some of these are are artificial some of  
22 them shouldn't really impact the redistricting, which we understand needs to be done. So I'd like  
23 to have it possible to reconsider some of these things. Like there's nothing sacrosanct about having

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 5 districts. Most cities of the size of Miami have more representatives than 5 on the governing  
2 board. Thank you.

3 Commissioner King: Thank you, one thing I believe I made it clear at our meetings that  
4 this process wouldn't be driven by time or money. Didn't I say that? But you. But. But. But you  
5 did not include that I said, okay?

6 Mr. Hannon: Chair, I'm sorry, I'm not getting these comments on the record.

7 Unidentified Speaker: [inaudible]

8 Commissioner King: It's okay. It's. It's. Thank you okay. Thank you okay. Gotcha, he's  
9 going to remove you, he's going to remove you. So I just want to reiterate for based on her  
10 comments that I did say that this body would not rush this process. We would not be driven because  
11 of trying to save money, that we would do our best efforts to make sure that this process was as  
12 fair and as baked as it possibly could be. No one, none of us wants this to happen. This is driven  
13 because we are required to do so and each commissioner was given the opportunity, we received  
14 this presentation just as it was said in the last meeting. Tuesday before close of business and each  
15 of each of your representatives – if you make another outburst, he will remove you. Each of your  
16 commissioners has the opportunity to share this information with their constituency, as I did with  
17 mine. So everybody is aware, we are not trying to hide any information from any of you, and we  
18 want your input, hence this meeting and others, and there more meetings to come, I am sure. Sir  
19 oh, ma'am. Is it your turn? I'm sorry. Go ahead.

20 Sue McConnell: My name is Sue McConnell, I'm the president of the Village Center Grove  
21 and what I'm going to say is not to disparage anyone or upset anyone. But for ten years, I came to  
22 every commission meeting until the pandemic. I know how it's run, to sit here and listen to all  
23 these people say how heartfelt they are about this situation and to have one commissioner not sit

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 in his chair is hurtful. This is why we vote for people, I know Commissioner Reyes is left for 5  
2 minutes I understand that. But to not sit here the whole time bothers me a lot, I mean, this is  
3 important to us. Coconut Grove, we're a family, we're a village, we're a fishing village, sailing  
4 village. It means a lot to us and I just want to say that we vote for you because you represent us,  
5 and that's what we'd like, and you can be in your office, but you can be working, you can be on  
6 the phone. You can be driving to the beach we don't know, thank you.

7 Commissioner King: Thank you. Thank you. Good afternoon.

8 Adam Asbury: Hi. My name is Adam Asbury, I'm a Grove resident, District 2. I just want  
9 to say I'm very happy with where where everything is going, where everything it's been my whole  
10 life, I've lived here in Coconut Grove. My great grandfather, my grandfather's from the Grove, of  
11 my mom's from the Grove. To come after and changed is the voting in the districts it's it's like  
12 taking our identity. It's like changing who we are and that's not just, you know, we were together,  
13 why would the commission propose something like this? It would potentially put all these people  
14 in this room, too, just to make us come here and literally cry, you know, like this is this is a big  
15 deal. This is who we are. The Grove of Coconut Grove. The Grove Heights. When I see you  
16 walking in the Grove, I'm so proud to see you what you've done. To see what you do for the water,  
17 to see what you do for everything and I wish you weren't like timed out, like they say. But if  
18 redirecting or rezoning, I think of this is the same thing if you're going to rezone the Grove, the  
19 Grove knew what they would do if anyone tried to rezone anything in Coconut Grove. They would  
20 vote in anonymously anonymously to stop it. So I wonder why we have to question this why we  
21 have to break this up so that we are not conquered I mean, we don't want to be divided and  
22 conquered we want to be one Grove because this is what we have always been since the beginning  
23 of the settlement here in the first the first town in Miami. So I'm very sorry I'm worked up, but



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 thank you for this opportunity to speak and please do the right thing, thank you.

2 Commissioner King: Thank you, Sir?

3 Len Sinto: Hi. My name is Len Sinto, I'm at 3091 Bird Avenue, so I'm still in that little  
4 wedge. It's been going north, and I've been there for 19 years, so I'm just short of your 20 year  
5 designation there. So I have been I was on the board of directors of the Village of Center Grove  
6 Neighborhood Association it's who had mentioned for several years. I'm also been actively  
7 involved for many years in the King Mango Strut, as I hope many of you know is a really fun and  
8 kind of spirited event that we do in Coconut Grove. That some people actually come and yoyo  
9 during and then so what I wanted to say about that, in fact, one year I pulled the permits for the  
10 parade and I dealt with one commissioner and one commissioner's office. So I hope I wouldn't  
11 have to do two or three commissioners' office to put the strut on again after the pandemic. Uh but  
12 when we do this about what I want to talk about is that we have a community of really obviously  
13 actively involved folks here, and that active involvement creates a spirit, a spirit of unity in  
14 Coconut Grove and what do we do with that? We take a key role in in the Coconut Grove Arts  
15 Festival and the King Mango Strut right. These events that when you do a Web search, what to do  
16 in Miami, it says Coconut Grove Arts Fest, it says King Mango Strut right? And so the folks that  
17 are involved in this neighborhood, they do this not just for this neighborhood, but the whole city  
18 of Miami benefits from the activity of these folks and it's because of that spirit that we have. So I  
19 would just ask you, we also have smaller events, Coconut Hut, Gifford Lane coming up a week  
20 from Sunday so a little smaller local Art Fest. Lastly, I just want to say that, you know we have an  
21 integrated we're integrated in the neighborhood, we're active in the neighborhood, we identify  
22 with the neighborhood we do a lot of things that benefit the city of Miami. So I ask you not to  
23 degrade that spirit, especially when there are viable and maybe less intrusive alternatives available.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Commissioner King: Thank you.

2 Len Sinto: Thank you.

3 Commissioner King: Ma'am?

4 Renee Schafer: Yes, Renee Schafer, 2571 Lincoln, resident over 45 years. I wanted to say  
5 that you are here and actually we are here in front of us and in front of you because we voted for  
6 you and we trusted that you would care about us and for us. We're asking you to evoke that trust  
7 we've given you. We know that there is a question, a problem to be solved, and we know that  
8 you've got the burden as designated, but we're here to work together. If there is a problem for you,  
9 there is a problem for us. We have representatives ready to give other solutions that could preserve  
10 many communities, not just ours. But we beg you do not divide Coconut Grove. Do not invade us.  
11 Do not make us divisional, we wish to remain one historically and as we are at present, do the right  
12 thing for the people and for Coconut Grove. Thank you.

13 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

14 Cherie Cole: Hello hi there. My name is Cherie Cole, I live at 2915 Jackson Avenue in the  
15 Parisian Village. We have the, just joy of having a little park on our street with a gate so the little  
16 ones can't run out. I am so proud to live in Coconut Grove, and I vehemently oppose this  
17 redistricting. I think of the Grove sometimes as being called the Groovy Grove, and I can remember  
18 walking to Eskill's clogs to buy my clogs, we are proud of the uniqueness of our community. I  
19 would ask each of you to very thoughtfully and timefully consider the uniqueness of Coconut  
20 Grove and the rich history we have of being one of the oldest communities in Miami. That is a  
21 value I am begging you not to take away that rich history and split us up and along with many  
22 other people that are here. I would also say to you that we are a diverse community that cares  
23 deeply for each other, we do things crossing over neighborhoods, filling a community fridge,

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 baking birthday cakes, all kinds of things go on quietly in the Grove. That is a neighborhood. These  
2 are people that care deeply about each other. It's not just about redistricting. I would ask you, how  
3 are some of the people going to get to the polling places with the new plan? I, for one, will take  
4 them. They will have their vote. I would just end by saying the Grove is not broken. You don't  
5 need to fix us. There are plenty of other things for you to fix in the city of Miami so I would ask  
6 you to leave us One Grove. You've got so many other things to fix, we are not broken, thank you.

7 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

8 Mickey Mersel: Good afternoon. My name is Mickey Mersel, I live at 2542 Swanson  
9 Avenue. You might remember me from two weeks ago, I used to live in Miami Beach. Moved up  
10 from Miami Beach to living in the Grove. But I was watching the presentation this morning, I saw  
11 a lot of numbers and it reminded me of my job for 40 years and I played with numbers. It was  
12 strictly numbers, but behind those numbers were people, and then I look out in the audience and I  
13 listen to the people talk and there's Black people, white people, old people, young people,  
14 Democrats, Republicans and this is one of the few times in recent years that I've seen people unite.  
15 No matter what they are, who they are for a common cause and I know there's a job that has to be  
16 done and all I'm asking you to do is look at the people and look at look at the zeal that's coming  
17 from these people and me and these people and like the other person said, do the right thing for  
18 the people, Thank you.

19 John Dolson: Hi. John Dolson, I reside at 4205 Lennox Drive, Coconut Grove. Want to  
20 address all the commissioners on this. I'm sorry, we don't have all five here because I have heard  
21 all of you over and over talk about the importance of a participatory government, the local  
22 interference I even heard that on the prayer today from Manolo Royes, Reyes. But I also heard on  
23 February 7th some very disturbing things a quote, The people who oppose the split are only about

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 the minority. I also heard a quote, every neighborhood thinks it's special, but they are not a decision  
2 to split Coconut Grove into three districts diminishes our voting power burns us with three  
3 commissioners to address collective issues like neighborhood conservation districts,  
4 environmental and historic preservation, and even local celebrations like Goombay, which I know  
5 that Mr. Reyes would like to bring back. I applaud that. On February 7th, 40 people, over 40 people  
6 spoke in opposition in splitting the Grove, nobody supported a split we haven't seen anybody  
7 supporting today. They were only the tip of the iceberg. They were not a vocal minority we've  
8 been one Grove since 1885 well, we got annexed in 1925. For the last 97 years, we've been  
9 protecting our borders vigorously through multiple generations we are a special group. You see  
10 that when you drive into the Grove from any direction. You see that when you walk around, see  
11 all the quirky restaurants and talk to many of the quirky people that are here, including old quirky  
12 people like me we are, in fact, a vocal majority. You five commissioners in all due respect, you  
13 are the vocal minority we want you to listen to stand by your policy of leaving decisions to the  
14 people who live here we vote and we remember support one Grove, one voice, one district. There  
15 are better alternatives available and we appreciate the time for you guys to sit up here in a listen  
16 all this I know it takes a lot. Thank you very much.

17 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

18 Harry Nixon: Good afternoon. My name is Harry Nixon I uh, excuse me. Prone to motion,  
19 like one of the previous speakers and I'm not a public speaker I think I would consider this my  
20 first political act. But I've been living and working in the Grove since I came to graduate school  
21 here in Miami. My first job was in a big blue building on the corner of Main Highway and Charles  
22 Avenue and I've lived on and off and worked on and off in the Grove ever since then. I live I'm  
23 the, my address is coconut and center, which sounds like it would be pretty close to the middle of

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Coconut Grove uh but I would be redistricted at this point from people two blocks away from me.  
2 I work downtown Coconut Grove, I go to church at Plymouth Congregational Church, where I'm  
3 very involved I also volunteer at the Christ Food Pantry in the West Grove, and my son goes to a  
4 really excellent middle school in the West Grove, and those would be in three different districts.  
5 This is my community it's my neighborhood I could walk to all those three places and I just came  
6 here to ask you guys to do what you can do to keep us a community. Thank you.

7 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

8 Debbie Dolson: My name is Debbie Dolson, 4205 Lennox Drive, Coconut Grove. My  
9 family has lived at this address for over 50 years. I support one Grove, one voice, one district, to  
10 US 1. I also represent Grove Watch, we have over 1300 members on our Facebook page, all  
11 dedicated to preserving our community of Coconut Grove. Over the years, we have heard all of  
12 you speak very positively about Coconut Grove, Commissioner Reyes, you have always Goombay  
13 Festival to Coconut Grove. Commissioner Carollo, you own property here and understand well  
14 what a cohesive community this is. Commissioner King, Coconut Grove shares many of the same  
15 issues that you have in your district. Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla has spoken many times of  
16 his enjoyment of visiting Coconut Grove, enjoying our restaurants in the special ambiance that we  
17 have. And of course, Commissioner Russell, you live here and you have been our steadfast  
18 supporter. Please understand that Coconut Grove is special, it is a special neighborhood. Please  
19 protect our heritage and diverse culture we have been one Grove since the 1880, 1880. And please  
20 help us support are One Grove efforts. There are better alternatives available in this redistricting  
21 plan. Thank you.

22 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

23 Alejandra Rondon: Good afternoon. My name is Alejandra Rondon and I live at 3309

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 William Avenue in Coconut Grove. I am a council member on the Coconut Grove Village Council.  
2 There are nine of us it is a very diverse Coconut Grove Village Council with people of all ages,  
3 professions and ethnicities. I have lived in Coconut Grove only two years and I'm sort of shocked  
4 that for being somewhere for two years, I'm willing to sit through 2 hours of public comments  
5 because of how much I care about this community and how it reminds me of no other place that  
6 I've had the privilege to live at. I was in Doral this morning for a work meeting and someone was  
7 telling me about like a legend in Miami, Holmes Braddock, who apparently would say, you know  
8 for really tough decisions. 50% of the people are going to hate you and 50% of the people are  
9 going to love you so why don't you just do the right thing? And so I really ask everybody here to  
10 please consider all options and do the right thing. Thank you.

11 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

12 Reynold Martin: Good afternoon Reynold Martin, Coconut Grove, 3325 Percival Avenue.  
13 My family has been here since the late 1800s we're from Grand Bahama. And Commissioner, I  
14 want to thank you for trying to bring the Goombay back. I've been on the phone day and night  
15 talking to people from Bimini, Exuma, Nassau, Grand Bahama, trying to bring the Goombay back  
16 in an authentic manner, I appreciate your effort to get that done. But I support one Grove, one  
17 district, one representative, and I'm a member of the Coconut Grove Village West Homeowners  
18 and Tenants Association and all of us think that one Grove ought to be the order of the day. Thank  
19 you.

20 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

21 David Winker: Good afternoon, David Winker, I live in the Manolo uh Manolo Reyes,  
22 Commissioner Manolo Reyes' District 4, I'm a happy constituent, thank you, my address is 2222  
23 SW 17th Street.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Ms. Méndez: Say that again, please.

2 David Winker: My address is 2222 SW 17th Street. Um I want to read you a legal concept  
3 and the legal concept is cracking. You're going to be hearing more about cracking. It's kind of a  
4 weird term, we don't often hear it, doesn't sound like a serious legal term, like habeas corpus or  
5 writ of mandamus. But what you're hearing today is a textbook case of cracking. Cracking is  
6 defined as in redistricting, the practice of drawing electoral districts that divide the population of  
7 a community or constituency across several districts. In doing so, the influence of the community  
8 or constituency may be reduced, that's what we've heard today. I can't tell you how much I respect  
9 the attorneys that did this. Mr. De Grandy is very good at this, probably the best in the state. Steve  
10 Cody is a friend of mine, has been involved in this for years. They do a good job. Commissioners,  
11 don't direct them to crack this community, please listen to the community and hear their voice and  
12 respect the one Grove. Thank you.

13 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

14 Nathan Kurland: Good afternoon Nathan Kurland, 3132 Day Avenue, Coconut Grove,  
15 Chairman of Coconut Grove Art Festival Steering Committee and worker on the Gifford Lane Art  
16 Festival. Announcer and board member of the King Mango Strut Parade. I don't mention these  
17 things to self-aggrandize. It's just that I love my community. A husband came home one day to  
18 his wife and said, what would happen if I hit the lottery? The wife said, I'll take half your money  
19 and I'll be out of here as quick as I can be. Husband said, fantastic, I hit the lottery, \$12, here is  
20 six, keep in touch. Commissioners, we've had a lot of very, very eloquent speakers today and what  
21 I'd like to remind you is that we are your constituents, whether we're District 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, whatever  
22 and the idea of telling you that story about keeping in touch is that hopefully you will keep in touch  
23 with us. This is a community that wants to stay a single community. Keep in touch, we are your

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 constituents, we do not wish to be split up, one Grove. Thank you very much.

2 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

3 Luisa: Good afternoon. My name is Luisa, I am a resident of the North Grove. I live in Bay  
4 Heights, Natoma Manors, as a Grove, I I'm here to express our opposition to the reassignment of  
5 the North Grove's neighborhoods into District 3. We are one community who has been, I'm sorry,  
6 we're one community who has been a part of the Grove through our historic right, our  
7 neighborhood, which includes the previous home of the Miami Science Museum, has been  
8 historically a part of Vizcaya. By cutting us out of District 2, you're essentially cutting us off from  
9 our history and sense of community. This proposed redistricting is absurd at best and no different  
10 than drawing a line down the center of Vizcaya itself or any particular home. I beg that you, please  
11 don't rush this decision and really take our time to investigate and understand the ramifications of  
12 these proposed changes. As a previous resident of District 3, I can attest to the huge contrast our  
13 neighborhood has to communities in District 3, 4 and 5, and we feel at home as one Grove in  
14 District 2. We kindly ask that you please respect the Grove's current boundaries. Take your time  
15 to explore other alternatives and explore and please respect the US 1 boundary and keep the North  
16 Grove, West Grove, or any other part of the Grove as one Grove. Thank you.

17 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

18 Lucian Ferster: Good afternoon.

19 Commissioner Carollo: By the way, Ma'am, in the last the plan that was presented here  
20 today as Commissioner Russell had requested before, Bay Heights is still and is being kept in  
21 District 2.

22 Luisa: What about Natomas —

23 Commissioner Carollo: So whatever information you were given now is erroneous because



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Bay Heights is still in District 2.

2 Luisa: What about Natoma Manors?

3 Commissioner Carollo: Natoma Manor is the area basically between the 17th

4 Luisa: Between Bay Heights and 17 —

5 Commissioner Carollo: In the beginning of of Bay Heights, that is in District 3.

6 Luisa: Yeah, we would like to try to keep that within District 2, whether it's North Grove,  
7 West Grove or any part of the Grove, we want to keep it as one Grove, when you ask my daughter  
8 where she lives, Honey, where do you live? She says — say it.

9 Luisa's Daughter: The Grove.

10 Commissioner Carollo: That's real cute.

11 Luisa: Thank you, and I'd like to keep it that way.

12 Commissioner Carollo: But, but can you repeat again so I could remember it? The  
13 difference that you said you saw in there is between Bay Heights in District 2 and District 3, 4 or  
14 5.

15 Luisa: So basically, what you're trying to do is cut.

16 Commissioner Carollo: And I don't know you had said that there is a huge difference.

17 Luisa: Oh, living in District 3, I lived — I lived all over Miami, I lived in Brickell, I lived  
18 everywhere and The Grove, whether it's in North Grove or West Grove, we're one community,  
19 it's very familiar. It's a place to raise kids, we want to keep that all of those values all at once.

20 Commissioner Carollo: Nevertheless, not what you said before. You used the phrase I'm  
21 saying and the big difference from Bay Heights to those other districts.

22 Luisa: There is a big difference. There are also other districts have a higher density, we  
23 don't have that density, we want to try to keep our community one, whether it's our best friend

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 lives in the Natoma Manors. It's one street over, it's four houses down, I don't want it to be a  
2 different neighborhood, I don't want it to be a different district, we ask that you try to keep the  
3 Grove entirely one long sliver, as opposed to chopping it up into whatever may be necessary.

4 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you. Good afternoon.

5 Lucian Ferster: Good afternoon, I want to thank you, Commissioners, for respectfully and  
6 patiently listening to all of this I don't want to be redundant. You've certainly gotten the message.  
7 Coconut Grove resists adamantly being split up and I don't have to repeat that. I live on Crawford  
8 Avenue in the South Grove, I've lived there since 1983. What I want to do is say this I certainly  
9 agree and I think everyone that has spoken agrees there have to be transitions for districts.  
10 However, what we don't understand, and I personally don't understand, is a watertight reason why  
11 Coconut Grove has to be split up. If this commission could say the Coconut Grove has to be split  
12 up for certain legal or social city business reasons that are watertight and understandable, I think  
13 that would make some sense. But I'm not hearing it. I'm not hearing it, what is said is diffuse,  
14 confusing, and frankly, I think this has to be rethought, I think there's a way around this. You folks  
15 can do it we're asking you to do it. Thank you very much.

16 Commissioner King: Thank you.

17 Mr. Hannon: Chair I'm sorry if I get the speaker's name?

18 Commissioner King: Sir?

19 Lucian Ferster: [inaudible]

20 Commissioner King: I'm sorry. Could you say your name in the mic for the clerk?

21 Lucian Ferster: L-U-C-I-A-N-F-E-R-S-T-E-R, okay?

22 Mr. Hannon: Thank you, sure.

23 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon?

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Julian Roca: Thank you. My name is Julian Roca, 2921 SW 30th Court. I am in between  
2 Bird and US 1, so strongly that an area that will be redistricted uh you. I have two daughters, eight  
3 and five. They go to the public school system. They go to Coconut Grove Elementary. Most of our  
4 friends live on all of the streets that were mentioned here today, Bay, Indiana, Ohio, Jackson,  
5 Center, Fro, Swanson. We walk through each other's houses every Friday. We go to people's  
6 garages and we talk about the issues that our district has. And we also talk about the solutions that  
7 we propose. Moving ahead and looking at this proposal, I feel that some of our community is sort  
8 of breaking apart and we're only a couple blocks away from each other. I want my two daughters  
9 to grow up in this place that I consider to be magic. If you haven't lived here, you wouldn't know.  
10 It is magic. I want my daughters to live in one Grove. Thank you.

11 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

12 John Stovall: Good afternoon. My name is John Stovall of 2230 Lincoln Avenue, I've been  
13 here for 40 years. I certainly believe in one Grove. Please keep it. I concede the rest of my time  
14 for Mel.

15 Commissioner King: Didn't you already speak, sir?

16 Mel Meinhardt: He says, he's giving me his —

17 Commissioner King: Oh, he's giving you okay, go ahead.

18 Mel Meinhardt: Thank you. My name is Mel Meinhardt, I'm actually the organizer of One  
19 Grove and the reason that many of the folks who came here came. We have learned a lot. The thing  
20 I love about Miami and Coconut Grove is there's so much to learn, so many things that can be  
21 done and so much creativity that can be done. The thing I learned today that was most surprising  
22 is that Commissioner Carollo was involved in the creation of the representation of Coconut Grove  
23 as a district in District 2 so many, many years just before I got here, sir, I'm told that, is that

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 correct?

2 Commissioner Carollo: Let me be very clear to you, I was the author of creating districts  
3 in the city so that we would have a balanced representation.

4 Mel Meinhardt: And I would like to thank you publicly for being at the forefront of creating  
5 the representation system in the city of Miami. I appreciate very much greatly. It's clear that the  
6 baby you hatched or the baby you gave birth to more than 20 years ago has reached a point in  
7 which the people are passionate and care about the representation. And for that, sir, I admire you.  
8 I thank you for your foresight and I also, sir, ask you and – with the wisdom that I hope you'll  
9 show, the wisdom not to cut your baby.

10 Commissioner Carollo: No.

11 Mel Meinhardt: And let us go and let us keep going. Thank you very much, Commissioner  
12 Carollo.

13 Commissioner Carollo: I appreciate that, but if you think you're going to get up here and  
14 try to somehow in your mind paint me into a corner by being polite, you're not going to accomplish  
15 that uh and let me —

16 Mel Meinhardt: No sir, I'm learning every day.

17 Commissioner Carollo: But let me be as clear as I can. When I did that, I was mayor of the  
18 city. We had had an election that someone that looked like her [pointing to Commissioner King]  
19 was no longer here. You had four Hispanic commissioners and you had my dear friend J.L.  
20 Plummer, that Coconut Grove uh – after serving so many years decided that they don't want him  
21 when we went to districts. So Plummer was the only non-Hispanic in the commission and if we  
22 would've had another election, and Plummer would not have ran, you probably would have had  
23 five Hispanics on the commission. Just like now, if it would be a citywide vote, you would have

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 five Hispanics up here. So I put my neck on the line and I said, no, I'm not going to wait for a  
2 couple more elections and not have an African American in this commission, because that's what  
3 it would've required. Just because you don't have a representation from a certain minority group  
4 automatically you don't get to go to court and you get that. You have to show that it's a pattern,  
5 not necessarily that the guy that they voted out is someone that people didn't want, and you can't  
6 do that in one election. So I went out knowing the pluses and frankly, all the negatives the districts  
7 bring and ask for the residents of Miami to vote for districts and for the mayor to be an executive  
8 mayor like it is today, and I was the first executive mayor of the city of Miami. And that's how the  
9 district came. We, yes, gerrymandered District 2, so that someone that would be of an Anglo  
10 background, not Hispanic, would be elected. And that's why District 2 crossed into – across the  
11 highway, and a big chunk of a Hispanic district was put into District 2 because we had to balance  
12 the population within the five districts. In order to accommodate that and to make sure that there  
13 were enough African Americans in District 5 to elect an African American from District 5, we  
14 gerrymandered and broke up numerous neighborhoods into the other three – in the other three  
15 districts, and particularly District 3 and District 4. And that's how we came about today. And  
16 we've had since then a couple of more revisions, I think Mr. De Grandy has been the guy who's  
17 been doing it all these years so, I mean, we haven't gone and try to pick anybody else to put  
18 something different or hoodwink people. We kept the same guy that we've had, so throughout the  
19 different revisions since then, uh we've had to cut into other areas. Originally District 2 went all  
20 the way to the end of the city of Miami past Biscayne Boulevard to 86th Street. That had to be  
21 changed in the prior revision because of the growth that came, other areas had to be changed and  
22 this is why we have the dilemma that we are discussing today.

23 Mel Meinhardt: Thank you sir.

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 Commissioner Carollo: But thank you for your words and your input.

2 Commissioner King: Thank you Thank you. ma'am. Good afternoon.

3 Joyce Nelson: Hi I haven't got to see you in person yet. This first time. Joyce Nelson, 2535  
4 Inagua Avenue, I moved to the Grove in 1974, so I have seen it all, everything so everybody is  
5 been up on the dais.

6 Joe Carollo: Hi Joyce, remember me?

7 Joyce Nelson: Yes — and I have traveled the world I've been everywhere and I'm very  
8 fortunate to have done that I'm glad I did it before I was in this condition because now I can't. But  
9 I've been everywhere except Australia and New Zealand and there's nowhere else I want to live.  
10 I could have moved to California. You know, New York, Louisiana is the only place I want to live  
11 now is in South Africa on safari. That's my favorite. But this is I don't I love coming home to the  
12 Grove and and I'm not troubled by anything. It's a great neighborhood It always has been and I  
13 met all these wonderful people as a community activist for 30 years, trying to preserve the Grove  
14 and we're still doing it. We're not we're not going to give up, so it's just ridiculous to think that  
15 you would divide it up we've been together for almost 200 years and we want to remain that way.  
16 Thank you.

17 Commissioner King: Thank you. Good afternoon.

18 James Torres: Good afternoon. James Torres, president of DNA, District 2, Downtown  
19 Miami. Kind of swallowing my words here because there's a lot of emotion in the room, and I  
20 understand that. But at the end of the day, the redistricting is a draft that we're talking about, and  
21 that's kind of been lost in translation today. And when the DNA got the information, they call me  
22 and they go, James, don't jump out of your 25th floor window because District 5 is going to be  
23 right at your doorstep on 2nd Street I said, that's great because I remember the time, the time that

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 I met you I said, I look forward to working with you. So that's going to kind of happen and that's  
2 the reality, so we can't change everything because we understand that the population is what's  
3 demanding this drive. I know that the Grovites, quote unquote, are passionate about their  
4 neighborhood, we understand that. Downtown is passionate about their neighborhood. So what  
5 we're asking is the key word today should be this is a draft. This this is an exercise. So we kindly  
6 ask all the commissioners, because District 2 has relationships with the Bayfront Trust  
7 Commission, with the DDA, Manolo Reyes and of course, our commissioner Ken Russell. Is it  
8 complicated at times? Yes, but we work through it. That's the calm it's kind of funny that we're  
9 meeting again and we're moving forward so please kindly look at all viable options that are  
10 available in this draft scenario that you have. Thank you.

11 Commissioner Carollo: Let me ask you something.

12 Commissioner King: Thank you.

13 Commissioner Carollo: James, I may ask the Chair first.

14 James Torres: Yes, sir.

15 Commissioner Carollo: Have you found that by having to work with more commissioners,  
16 in, in a sense, is given, uh Downtown uh, uh a plus versus a disadvantage?

17 James Torres: I would tell you it's a plus because it creates diversity It also allows us to  
18 know what other things are happening in certain districts. So it's not a negative, but sometimes it  
19 can be complicated because we can't reach certain things. That's the good and the bad. But at the  
20 end of the day, it's something that we can't control. But we can give you input and that's how  
21 come I'm using the keyword today as a draft that I hope you guys really look at every viable option  
22 that's available.

23 Commissioner Carollo: Do you like peacocks?

**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 James Torres: Not on my car, but I think they are great.

2 Commissioner Carollo: And I'm just wondering so I'm going to talk about peacocks now  
3 I want to preserve a peacocks save the peacocks.

4 James Torres: Save the peacock.

5 Commissioner Carollo: I'm getting concerned that the more I drive through Coconut  
6 Grove, they're disappearing everywhere and it's not the Coconut Grove, the historical Coconut  
7 Grove that I remember.

8 James Torres: Well, downtown has the roosters, so well, you know, I'm just pointing that  
9 out.

10 Commissioner Carollo: Yeah, but you might get some peacocks, too.

11 James Torres: Thank you.

12 Commissioner Carollo: Yeah, but you might get some peacocks, you know.

13 James Torres: So, I appreciate it so, please, if we can use the word, this is a draft that  
14 everyone knows that we all have to work together.

15 Commissioner King: Thank you.

16 James Torres: Thank you for your time, thank you.

17 Commissioner King: Thank you. Thank you, ma'am. Good afternoon.

18 Melissa Meyer: Good afternoon. Melissa Meyer, Village West homeowner and 31-year  
19 Grove resident, AIA associate, architectural designer and LEED AP building design and  
20 construction and adjunct professor of architecture at Miami-Dade College. Your dividing,  
21 reconfiguring, shuffling and manipulation of Miami's first and most historically and culturally  
22 significant neighborhood is analogous to a group of narrow minded focused teenage boys  
23 attempting to divide a Casola's meat lover's pizza. Not since the annexation of Coconut Grove



**Transcript 4A - Miami City Commission - Feb. 25, 2022 - Morning Session**

1 into the city of Miami in 1925 has our village been under such an egregious threat of a dilution of  
2 our cohesive village identity that would burden our residents and civic organizations with triple  
3 meetings with multiple commissioners on critical village wide initiatives that our residents are  
4 historically unified on. Effectively crippling our undivided voice. Isn't that the real intention  
5 behind this disrespectful gerrymandering?

6 Commissioner King: Thank you.

7 Melissa Meyer: That's a question for you.

8 Commissioner King: Thank you,

9 Commissioner Carollo: Would you like me to answer you?

10 Commissioner King: No.

11 Commissioner Carollo: I'd be happy to answer you.

12 Commissioner King: No

13 Melissa Meyer: Commissioner King: No yes, please that's a question for you —

14 Commissioner King: No, no, no. We, is there anyone else here that would like to speak on  
15 public comments? Anyone else would like to speak on public comments? Seeing none. The public  
16 comment period is now closed and we are going to take a break.

17 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you

18 Commissioner King: We will return at 3:30.

19 Commissioner Carollo: Thank you.



**Vanan Online Services, Inc.**  
Think Service Think Vanan

**Certificate of Transcription**


Transcription of

**Special Commission Meeting- February252022 .mp4**

We, Vanan Online Services, Inc. a professional transcription company, hereby certify that the above-mentioned document(s) has/have been transcribed by our qualified and experienced transcriber(s) is/are accurate and true transcription of the original document(s).

This is to certify the correctness of the transcription only. Our transcriber is in no way related, by immediate family ties or marriage, to any parties related to the materials transcript.

A copy of the transcription is attached to this certification.

  
**Crystal Nichols, Production Manager,**



Dated : 16<sup>th</sup> day of August,2022

Vanan Online Services, Inc.  
ATA Member #266532  
ISO 9001:2015

**Central Park Corporate Center, 1320 Central Park Blvd. Suite 200,  
Fredericksburg VA 22401  
Office: (888) 535-5668  
Email: [support@vananservices.com](mailto:support@vananservices.com)  
Website: [www.vananservices.com](http://www.vananservices.com)**